

## African responses to Covid-19: approaches, gaps and ways forward

Dr Lesong Conteh & Dr Lucy Kanya LSE Health, Department of Health Policy



### Outline of the Webinar

• Introduction to AHOP

COVID-19

- What was hypothesized across Africa?
- What is currently happening?
  - What do we know?
  - What don't we know?
- Why the current Covid-19 impact?
- What does the future hold?





A regional partnership to promote evidence-informed policy-making

## What is AHOP?











Institut Pasteur









#### **OBSERVATORY MODEL**

#### Best practice for knowledge brokering and evidence transfer

Rigorous analysis of health systems Production of timely, reliable and comparative evidence Dissemination of outputs that are useful and usable

 $\bigcirc$ 

 $(\mathbf{O})$ 

European Observatory

African Health Observatory Platform

Asia-Pacific Observatory

#### **REGIONAL PLATFORM**





Part of 'Health Systems in Transition' series; detailed reviews of a country's health system, reform and policy initiatives

Policy briefs

Policy dialogues

HiTs

Short, tailored evidence reviews that address policy-makers' needs

Comparative and thematic studies

In-depth analysis of specific health systems functions or issues



Highly focused events to facilitate knowledge exchange and mutual learning among policy-makers

#### **REGIONAL PLATFORM**

Senegal Nigeria

Rwanda Kenya

Ethiopia

KEMRI Wellcome Trust

 University of Rwanda – School of Public Health
University of Addis Ababa – College of Health Sciences
University of Nigeria – Health Policy Research Group
Institut Pasteur de Dakar - Epidemiology, Clinical Research and Data Science

Hosted by the WHO's African Health Observatory

Research led by a growing network of National Centres

Supported by a consortium of national, regional and global technical partners

Informed by policy-maker input to Platform Steering Committee

Funded by a seed grant from the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation

### ADDRESSING THE GAPS

#### Intended outcomes



Increased national and regional scope to produce and share health systems analysis

íÍÍ

Increased awareness and uptake of available evidence and expertise by policy-makers

### Up coming Covid-19 Outputs



### Covid-19

# What was hypothesised for Africa?

## Worst-case scenario: Predicted deaths from coronavirus if nothing is done



## **COVID-19** Protecting Lives and Economies



**People:** Anywhere between 300,000 and 3.3 million African people could lose their lives as a direct result of COVID-19, depending on the intervention measures taken to stop the spread.

These figures are a prediction of future events, in a hypothetical scenario where no measures are taken to stop the virus spreading.







#### Hospital beds per 10,000 inhabitants





Source: DW research, most recent availab A See github.com/dw-data/coronavirus-afric

A mechanical ventilator sits by a bed at the Aga Khan University Hospital in Nairobi, Kenya Meinhardt/Bloomberg via Getty Images

#### WHO Projections if COVID-19 containment measures fail in Africa\*



(47 WHO African Region countries)



of whom 82 000 to 167 000 would be severe cases

#### Lockdown in Africa - is the treatment worse than the disease?

By Alexander C. R. Hammond | @AlexanderHammo



#### Top economist: US coronavirus response is like 'third world' country

Joseph Stiglitz attacks Donald Trump, saying US on course for second Great Depression

Coronavirus - latest updates

23,199

• See all our coronavirus coverage



▲ Joseph Stiglitz: 'The public social safety net is not working.' Photograph: Vladimir Gerdo/Tass

Donald Trump's botched handling of the Covid-19 crisis has left the US looking like a "third world" country and on course for a second Great Depression, one of the world's leading economists has warned.

IMPACT OF THE CORONAVIRUS (COVID 19) ON THE AFRICAN ECONOMY



### Covid-19

### **Current Situation?**

#### **Current Situation**

### • What do we know?







https://covid19.who.int/

Accessed 20<sup>th</sup> April 2020

WHO Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Dashboard





Globally, as of 10:21am CEST, 20 May 2020, there have been 4,761,559 confirmed cases of COVID-19, including 317,529 deaths, reported to

#### **Case Comparison**

WHO Regions



Source: World Health Organization









Cases by Country Deaths by Country Recoveries by Country

#### Testing: How African countries compare with the world



Africa CDC



Source: Africa CDC



References: AfricaCDC

#### **Current Situation**

### • What <u>don't</u> we know?



#### Impact on marginalised populations



### #COVID19

Leaving No-One behind in the Disability-Inclusive Response  "I don't have any information on how to prevent contagion from COVID-19. No one told me for instance that I have to sanitize my cane, I have to rely on my own common sense and knowledge. Plus, I don't have a sanitizer nor masks", AK, blind woman, Kenya. Stigma, fears of quarantine hinder Kenya's COVID-19 fight

NEWS / KENTA

COVID-19 testing ramps up across worst-affected parts of Kenya, but many are worried they will be forced into quarantine.

ty Catherine Sol

Kenyans Confined at Quarantine Facilities See It as Sentence

Hallandersen der Transfer



Despite the concerns around the spread of the coronavirus, the greatest enemy is not the virus itself, but "fears, rumours and stigma". Dr. Tedros, WHO DG



#### Six killed by Kenyan police enforcing coronavirus curfew: HRW

HRW condemns 'brutality' during curfew enforcement; police say they have dealt with officers who 'misbehaved'.

32 Apr 2020 🛉 💆



Kenya's night-time curlew came into effect on March 27 [Senon Maina/AFP]

14 12 ALAN ALAN



Ugandan police officers and members of a paramilitary force patrol during a curfew in Kampala, April 29. Sumy Sadurni / Getty Images

#### Funding gaps

 The Kenya Medical Research Institute (Kemri) is so broke that it cannot replenish Covid-19 testing materials, protective gear and the much-needed reagents.

Daily nation, May 13, 2020

#### Kemri is dead broke amid Covid-19 fight

WEDNESDAY MAY 13 2020

🎔 f in 🖶 🖂



A researcher prepares reagents for testing the samples for the Covid-19 coronavirus at the laboratory of Kenya Medical Research Institute (Kemri) on April 23, 2020.PHOTO | BRIAN ONGORO | AFP

### Other issues

Disruption of routine services, including chronic care

 ".... a 70 years old woman diagnosed with ovarian cancer had been worked up for laparotomy and radical excision of the cancer by a senior gynecologist a few weeks prior to March 12, 2020. However, with the report of the first 2 cases and the ensuing response by the hospital, the gynecologist transferred the patient to a junior consultant for her management, but the patient is yet to have her surgery after over six weeks since she was cleared for surgery" Surgeon, teaching hospital.

2. High informality raises challenges:

- Tracing and supporting contacts (>80% informal sector)
- Implementation of social assistance



### Covid-19

### Why the impact so far?

### Demographics

In sub-Saharan Africa 3% of the population are ≥ 65 years old 43% < 15 years old

European Union 20% of the population are ≥ 65 years or older 17% are < 15 years Source: United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division (2013). World Population Prospects: The 2012 Revision.



Sub-Saharan Africa

### Swift introduction of containment measures?

- Most African countries implemented lockdowns far earlier than highincome countries.
- By the end of April at least 42 African countries had done so; 38 of these were in place for at least 21 days.

#### COVID-19: Government Response Stringency Index, May 15, 2020

Our World in Data

The Government Response Stringency Index is a composite measure based on nine response indicators including school closures, workplace closures, and travel bans, rescaled to a value from 0 to 100 (100 = strictest response).

This index simply records the number and strictness of government policies, and should not be interpreted as 'scoring' the appropriateness or effectiveness of a country's response.



### Health System Resilience

#### Three key processes of resilience

resilience usefullv Three processes are distinguished: absorption, adaptation and transformation. Suitable preparation will allow a health system to **absorb** some shocks without major change or redistribution of resources. With greater demands, the system needs to *adapt* through reallocation of resources and changes to policies and procedures. Greater or prolonged demands may require innovation to *transform* a health system's service offer or way of working.

#### Principles of Health Systems Resilience in the Context of COVID-19 Response

- 1. Develop flexible pathways for medical supplies
- 2. Prioritise a list of essential health services.
- 3. Build trust with local communities
- 4. Foster good communication at all system levels
- 5. Support, recognise and encourage staff
- 6. Facilitate rapid resource flow to front line providers and greater flexibility in its use
- 7. Ensure agile tracking of health information.
- 8. Cultivate effective partnerships and networks

### The 'Ebola Legacy'?



#### Global Leadership to Support Africa's Response to COVID-19

### African countries that faced Ebola outbreaks use lessons to fight COVID-19, experts say

Uganda has redirected resources for tracing Ebola cases toward coronavirus patients, but not all countries are as well prepared.



\_\_\_\_\_ Staff members of the Health Ministry perform a COVID-19 test at a private residence in Goma, Democratic Republic of the Congo, on March 31, 2020. Alexis Huguet / AFP - Getty Images

### Other suggestions?

- Covid-19 is there we are just not testing and identifying it?
  - Excess mortality data to support this?
- Transport links ?
- Protection of other vaccines on the EPI schedule ?
- Very few people who are obese, although the numbers are rising?
- We do not know as yet.....



### Covid-19

### Evidence & Insights from Ethiopia

# COVID-19 in Ethiopia: A big escape or a long wait?


Authors

Dr. Dawit Wondimagegn<sup>1</sup>, Abiy Seifu Estifanos<sup>2</sup>, Dr.Helen Yifter Bitew<sup>1</sup>, Dr. Tesfamariam Aklilu<sup>1</sup>, Dr. Yidnekachew Asrat<sup>1</sup>, Kehabtimer Shiferaw, Dr Adane Petros<sup>1</sup>, Dr. Tewodros Haile<sup>1</sup>, Dr. Adamu Addissie<sup>2</sup>, Prof. Damen Hailemariam<sup>2</sup>, Dr. Wondwossen Amogne<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>School of Medicine, Addis Ababa University <sup>2</sup>School of Public Health, Addis Ababa University

#### Contents

Introduction

Method

Results

Discussions

Recommendations

# More than 110 million population

Among 13 top priority African countries

**35** times a week flight to China

has one of the lowest confirmed cases



#### Method

#### Focused Group Discussion

- Clinical
- Public Health
- Health System Leadership
- Policy

# Narrative analysis of the evidence

#### Panel discussion with a larger group

# Findings of brainstorming

Testing related issues	Immunity and low susceptibility	Public health Measures	Time in the phase's of Pandemic
Self and institutional reporting	High infectious disease rate providing protection	?early intervention	10 <sup>th</sup> week
Disclosure	Environment	Quarantine	Pre growth phase
Contact tracing	Age, Urban/rural ratio	Isolation	
Prolonged incubation period and asymptomatic shedding	Social determinants: culture, diet, pets	Banning mass gathering	
Testing Capacity	Immunizations, Hygiene hypothesis	Border Closure	
Narrow case definition	Genetic diversity	School closure	
Specimen Collection/transportation	Cross immunity with other virus	Health education and campaigns	
Training and Experience	Prevalence of Comorbidities		
Standardization for local use	Travel and Movement rate		
Low adjuvant investigations	General naiveté for modern medicine		

#### **Testing Related Issues**



## Testing related factors 65,760 tests 389 Confirmed cases

#### Testing related issues

- Testing coverage
- Number of tests for each confirmed cases
- Case fatality



OurWorldInData.org/coronavirus • CC BY

# Comparison of Mortality before and after the COVID-19 pandemic and from the last year



### Immunity and low susceptibility

### Burden of infectious disease and COVID-19

- Negative association of burden of TB and Malaria with COVID-19
- BCG Vaccination

#### Malaria and COVID-19

Malaria



COVID-19



#### Genetic diversity viral and Host

- ACE2 receptor overexpression
- Patient derived mutations
- Around 30
- Difference in virulence More than 270 times

#### Environment

- Altitude
- Temperature and Humidity



Does the pathogenesis of SAR-CoV-2 virus decrease at high-altitude? Respiratory Physiology & Neurobiology. 2020 ;277:103443.

#### Altitude



#### Altitude



- Other corona viruses show seasonality<sup>1</sup>
- Most viable at low relative humidity [20%] and low temperatures (4 degree Celsius)<sup>2</sup>
- Cold and dry conditions may facilitate the spread of the covid-19<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>K. H. Chan, et al. Advances in Virology., Vol. 2011, 2011.

<sup>2</sup> Kai Feng et al. arxiv:2003.05003 [q-bio.pe]. 2020

Abstract. This paper investigates the influence of air temperature and relative humidity on the transmission of COVID-19. After estimating the serial interval of COVID-19 from 105 hand-collected pairs of the virus carrier and the infected, we calculate the daily effective reproductive number, R, for each of all 100 Chinese cities with more than 40 cases. Using the daily R values from January 21 to 23, 2020 as proxies of nonintervened transmission intensity, we find, under a linear regression framework, high temperature and high humidity significantly reduce the transmission of COVID-19, respectively. One-degree Celsius increase in temperature and one percent increase in relative humidity lower R by 0.0225 and 0.0158, respectively. This result is consistent with the fact that the high temperature and high humidity reduce the transmission of influenza and SARS. It indicates that the arrival of summer and rainy season in the northern hemisphere can effectively reduce the transmission of the COVID-19. We also developed a website to provide R of major cities around the world according to their daily temperature and relative humidity: <u>http://covid19-report.com/#/r-value</u>







#### Social determinants

- Age
- Urban/Rural ratio
- International exposures

#### Urban vs. rural



Rural COVID-19 Cases Lag Urban Areas but Are Growing Much More Rapidly , April 3, 2020, S.J. Goetz, Z. Tian; NERCRD and Penn State University

#### Urban vs. rural



Rural COVID-19 Cases Lag Urban Areas but Are Growing Much More Rapidly, April 3, 2020, S.J. Goetz, Z. Tian; NERCRD and Penn State University

### Social determinants

Composite Country List of Key Risk Factors										
Country	Int'l Exposure	Public Health System	Density of Urban Areas	Total Pop. in Urban Areas	Pop. Age	Gov't Transparency	Press Freedom	Conflict Magnitude	Forced Displacement	Risk Total (out of 45)
South Sudan	2	5	5	3	2	5	5	5	5	37
DRC	3	5	3	5	1	5	4	5	5	36
Nigeria	5	5	2	5	2	4	3	4	5	35
Sudan	3	3	4	4	2	5	4	5	5	35
Cameroon	3	4	3	3	2	4	5	3	5	32
Fount	5	1	3	5	4	3	А	2	А	31
Ethiopia	3	3	4	5	2	2	4	3	5	31
CAR	1	5	3	2	3	4	4	4	4	30
Somalia	1	5	1	2	2	5	4	5	5	30
Chad	1	5	5	3	1	5	4	1	4	29
Equatorial Guinea	4	5	3	1	3	5	5	1	1	28
Libya	3	1	1	2	4	5	4	4	4	28
Uganda	3	2	4	4	1	4	4	1	5	28
Algeria	4	1	2	4	5	3	4	1	3	27
Angola	3	4	4	3	1	4	4	1	3	27
Côte d'Ivoire	4	4	2	3	3	3	3	1	4	27
Mali	2	5	4	3	1	3	3	2	4	27
Morocco	5	1	3	4	5	2	4	1	2	27
Mozambique	4	4	3	3	1	4	3	2	3	27
Republic of Congo	3	3	4	2	2	5	4	1	3	27
Burkina Faso	2	4	3	3	2	2	3	3	4	Ac <b>te</b> vate

Africa Center for Strategic Studies, Mapping Risk Factors for the Spread of COVID-19 in Africa, *infographic*, April 3, 2020.

### Comorbidities

- Hypertension: 16%<sup>1</sup>
- Diabetes: 3.2%<sup>1</sup>
- Smoking: 5%<sup>2</sup>
- Cardiovascular disease: 4-24%<sup>3</sup>
- Cancer: 0.3%<sup>3</sup>
- Asthma and COPD: 4% and 17%<sup>3</sup>

 <sup>1</sup>Prevalence of high bloodpressure, hyperglycemia, dyslipidemia, metabolic syndrome and their determinants in Ethiopia: Evidences from the National NCDs STEPS Survey, 2015
<sup>2</sup> WHO report on the global tobacco epidemic, 2019 Country profile Ethiopia
<sup>3</sup>Epidemiology of major Non-communicable Disease in Ethiopia: Asystematic review, Awoke Misganawet al. J Health Popul Nutr. 2014 Mar.

# Public Health Interventions are slowing the pandemic

Interventions to mitigate early spread of SARS-CoV-2 in Singa...

Table Estimated median or cumulative number of SARS-CoV-2 infections on day 80 by location, intervention, and level of infectivity

	Baseline	Quarantine	School closure	Workplace distancing	Combined intervention		
R 0=2-0							
Total number of infections	727 000 (670 000–776 000)	130 000 (38 000–244 000)	97 000 (14 000–219 000)	67 000 (11 000–145 000)	50 000 (2000–143 000)		
Home community	372 000 (339 000–411 000)	66 000 (23 000–129 000)	46 000 (11 000–113 000)	28 000 (8000–79 000)	21 000 (1200–68 000)		
School	4300 (3700–4300)	600 (100–1200)	500 (27–1000)	300 (33–800)	200 (11–800)		
Workplace	351 000 (327 000–361 000)	63 000 ( <u>15 000–127 000</u> )	51 000 (3000–105 000)	38 000 (2800–65 000)	28 000 (800–67 000)		

#### R 0=5-2

4					
Total number of infections	1 207 000 (1 164 000–1 249 000)	520 000 (268 000-754 000)	466 000 (175 000–728 000)	320 000 (116 000–558 000)	258 000 (65 000–508 000)
Home community	640 000 (623 000–675 000)	264 000 (144 000–410 000)	235 000 (92 000–366 000)	163 000 (66 000–281 000)	132 000 (34 000–265 000)
School	7100 (7200–7900)	3000 (1400–4000)	2400 (1300–3600)	1500 (800–3400)	1300 (300–2800)
Workplace	560 000 (550 000–584 000)	253 000 (140 000–390 000)	228 000 (82 000–358 000)	156 000 (49 000–274 000)	124 000 (31 000–241 000)



## Timelines for NPI's in ETHIOPIA



#### Time in the phase's of the pandemic

- First case was detected on march 13
- 10 weeks from the first case
- Most countries had in 10,000 cases at 08 weeks

#### Conclusion

- It seems the testing coverage alone can't explain the current status
- There seems to be a trend towards low susceptibility
- Public health interventions may have contributed
- We may still be in early (pre growth phase)

• There is no single explanation.



#### Covid-19

#### What does the future hold?

#### Africa's infection trajectory versus comparators, as at 5 May 2020



Source: Based on data from Johns Hopkins University and Africa Centres for Disease Control and Prevention, 5 May 2020

#### Weekly edition 📃 Menu



Middle East & Africa May 16th 2020 edition >

The Economist

Today

Why covid-19 seems to spread more slowly in Africa Subscribe

"While covid-19 likely won't spread as exponentially in Africa as it has elsewhere in the world, it likely will smoulder in transmission hotspots,"

# Dr Matshidiso Moeti, the Director for the WHO, AFRO

Cabore JW, Karamagi HC, Kipruto H, et al. The potential effects of widespread community transmission of SARS-CoV-2 infection in the AFRO Region: a predictive model. BMJ Global Health2020;5

## Gradual lifting of lockdowns









#### THE DAILY NEWSLETTER Sign up to our daily email newsletter



News Podcasts Video Technology Space Physics Health More \* Shop Tours Events Job

#### Ebola outbreak caused twice as many deaths as we thought

f 💙 🕲 🛅 🎯 🖸 😨

LIFE 24 February 2016

By Andy Coghlar



#### John Moore/Getty Imag

The Ebola outbreak is estimated to have killed almost twice as many people as we thought, by diverting resources away from illnesses such as malaria, HIV and tuberculosis.

An effective Vaccine – A Global Public Good?

#### Intended and Unintended Consequences

The Impact of COVID-19 on Global Poverty

Source: PoycalNet • The global poverty rate is measured as the share of the world's population living on less than \$1.90 per day.

#### The impact of COVID-19 (Coronavirus) on global poverty: Why Sub-Saharan Africa might be the region hardest hit

DANIEL GERSZON MAHLER, CHRISTOPH LAKNER, R. ANDRES CASTANEDA AGUILAR & HAOYU WU | APRIL 20, 2020 This page in: English

#### Millions pushed into extreme poverty due to COVID-19



Millions of people



Regional Agenda COVID-19 Africa Healthcare Delivery

#### How youth and technology can drive Africa's COVID-19 response



Youth, technology and community healthcare: an integrated response

Image: REUTERS/Thomas Mukoya

#### 19 May 2020

Neema Kaseje Founder, Surgical Systems Research Group

Dan Kaseje Professor of Public Health, Tropical Institute of Community Health, Kisumu, Kenya



- Africa needs integrated responses to COVID-19 that build on countries' existing strengths and resources.
- Here we propose such a solution for Kenya, based on three factors: young people, technology, and community healthcare volunteers.
- This approach could serve Africa well for the future as well as during the current crisis.

#### Innovation & Opportunities

= TIME

CORONAVIRUS BRIEF YOUR QUESTIONS ANSWERED WEARING MASKS MEAT SHORTAGES S NEWSLETTER

Drones Are Delivering COVID-19 Tests in Ghana. Could the U.S. Be Next?



BY ARYN BAKER 😏 APRIL 22, 2020 11:27 AM EDT

 $\overline{\mathbf{B}}$  ismark Sarkodie had a situation on his hands. As the Municipal Director of Health Services for a rural district of Ghana, he had ordered an entire camp of 244 construction workers into quarantine when three of them tested



### Thank you

### Any Questions/ Comments?