

Coming to Terms with Forced Migration: An Intergenerational Study of Asia Minor

Refugee Memory in Greece

Abstract

This paper seeks to examine the potential effects of refugee memory through the historical parallel between the Greek-Turkish population exchange (1923) and the contemporary migration and refugee flows (2015). More specifically, while focusing on the case of Greece, the research questions that I aim to address are: how do people's family memories of forced relocation affect their attitudes towards contemporary migration? How do these memories change over time from one generation to the next? To unpack the fluid relationship between history, memory, and identity and to overcome the numerous methodological challenges, I will use a methodology, based on four case studies of Lesbos, Chios, Macedonia and Athens, of collecting primary sources using oral testimonies and archival evidence.

Migration and forced displacement in Greece: a historical parallel

Forced displacement has been experienced by a large percentage of people throughout the world. In the 19th and 20th centuries, with the aim of creating modern nation-states, the notions of homogeneity and exclusive citizenship were espoused as they were expressed in Western political thought and came in sharp contrast to multiethnic empires. By drawing boundaries within intermingled populations through forced assimilation, large-scale human displacement, ethnic cleansing, and mass killings, nation-states were built on 'victories as much as on defeats, on 'catastrophes' and traumas', shaping collective memories central to ethnic identities (Akogonul 2009:195).

In this changing reality, which began with the Balkan Wars (1912-1913) and World War I (1914-1918) and under the umbrella of international treaties, such as those prepared at the Paris Peace Conference in 1919 that established borders and territories, minority groups became an international concern. The passage from empire to nation-state brought about such population exchanges the Greek-Bulgarian voluntary population exchange (1919) and the compulsory population exchange between Greece and Turkey (1923). Specifically, under the Lausanne Convention of 30 January 1923, Greece and Turkey agreed on the compulsory exchange of populations of their respective religious minorities: Greek Orthodox Turkish nationals living in Turkish territory and Muslim Greek nationals living in Greek territory. The influx of refugees expelled from Turkey to Greece was estimated at around 1.2 million people, while the number of Muslims expelled to Turkey from Greece was approximately 360,000 (Ladas 1932:5). As a result, during a period of war (1912-1922) and economic deprivation, Greece increased its population by 25 percent. This exchange of populations poses paramount international interest in modern history since '[i]t was the first time in history that the transfer of large ethnic groups was tried as a means to separate nationally intermingled people' (Pentzopoulos 1962:18). In addition, it is central to the Greek identity, dominating 'the modern Greek consciousness as the fundamental event which has transformed the form and the character of the contemporary history of the nation' (Kitromilides 1972:372).

After the Second World War came other phases of migration and forced displacement to Greece. In the Cold War period and during the regime of Gamal Abdel Nasser and the rise of pan-Arab nationalism, harsh measures were enacted that led to the exodus of Greeks who were living in Egypt in 1961-1963. In the meantime, between 1955 and 1964-1965, due to repeat and destructive pressures by the Turkish state, the Greek Orthodox population of Istanbul was forcibly

expelled. The Greek-Turkish tension was mirrored in the division of Cyprus that led to significant inflows to Greece in 1974. In this year and after the end of the Greek military junta, political refugees of the Greek civil war returned to Greece from communist countries. In the context of the eventual collapse of the Soviet Union, between the late 1980s and early 1990s, '[t]he East-West migration phenomenon...across the old Cold War divide' was reflected in the arrivals of Pontic Greeks and undocumented immigrants, including an important migration wave from Albania (Voutira 2003:146).

Most significant, however, was the fact that in 2015, Greece, a country faced with a political and economic crisis, experienced the arrival of vast numbers of displaced people. According to the United Nations Refugee Agency, during 2015 and early 2016 more than one million migrants and refugees arrived in Greece (UNHCR 2018). Most of these people fled from violence and war in countries such as Syria, Afghanistan, Iraq, Pakistan, and Somalia and reached Greece by crossing from Turkey to the Aegean islands, such as the island of Lesbos (Triandafyllidou 2015:2). Lesbos is an island that constitutes an entry port for significant contemporary migration flows and whose present population composition has to a large degree been formed by the 1923 population exchange. In Greece, the case of Lesbos is far from rare given that a significant percentage of the country's current population is descended from refugees from Asia Minor.

Research questions

The research questions that I will address are:

1. How have family memories of the 1923 forced displacement changed over time from one generation to the next?
2. How do people with these family memories think about subsequent migration?
3. Does subsequent migration reactivate memories of forced displacement? If so, in what way?

The importance of these questions lies in the fact that while modern states have been shaped to a large extent by past relocation experiences of forced migration, the recent arrival of migrants introduced a great debate about the place of the newcomers in the host societies. Thus, the question that arises is how people with memories of forced displacement think about subsequent migrants and refugees. In Greece, a country that receives a high number of migratory inflows and whose present composition of population is rooted in past relocation experiences, the significance of the transmission of these memories and the extent to which they are lasting and changeable throughout generations is paramount.

My research begins with the assumption that 1923 family memories influence the way people with refugee roots think about subsequent migration by shaping contested memories. Tolerance and empathy are increased towards ethnic out-groups that are perceived as refugees, while on the other hand competitive victimization appears towards those considered to be migrants. Transmitted from one generation to the next, these memories change over time from reticent in the first generation with the direct traumatic experience, to latent in the second generation that was trying to get integrated into the host society, and to reawakened in the

following generations that, being fully integrated and facing another shock, rediscover their roots.

Literature review

Many facets of the compulsory population exchange have become the epicentres of various studies throughout the years. In the first period following the 1923 population exchange until the mid-1970s, scholars focused on the immediate aftermath of the population exchange usually following a more descriptive approach. In early works, scholars, such as Pentzopoulos, describe the ethnological, economic, political, social and cultural effects of the population exchange (Pentzopoulos 1962). In the late 1980s, the issue of refugee identification was examined mostly in anthropological studies such as the ethnography of Salamone, which focuses on a single-region case study (Salamone 1987). In 2003, a groundbreaking work, *Crossing the Aegean*, built a bridge between Greek and Turkish academics, examining the effects of the population exchange in both countries (Hirschon 2003). In the following decade, some scholars put emphasis on the coexistence between Christians and Muslims in Anatolia (Doumanis 2012), while others analysed the role of the collective past as a source of formulation of the present (Voutira 1991; Dinas and Fouka 2018).

Going beyond descriptive approaches and single-region case studies, this study will shift the focus to a micro-history and oral history approach in order to elucidate how Asia Minor refugee memory changes across generations, levels of memory, and historical periods as it is shaped by different social and political factors in the context of Europe's 'migration crisis'.

The conceptual tools

Memory

Levels of memory

There has been increasing interest among historians in the relationship between history and memory. Specifically, scholars distinguish between individual and collective frameworks of remembrance. One category of scholars, primarily comprised of cultural historians being influenced by sociologists such as Halbwachs, develops the role of collective memory through reconstructing the past within a social context and considering individual memory insignificant (Halbwachs 1980; Nora and Kritzman 1996). On the other hand, focusing on individual recollections, oral historians give authority to the interplay between individual and collective memory (Passerini 1979; Thompson 2017) and elucidate the relationship among individual, group, and national memories (Gildea 2010).

In my analysis, memory is conceptualised through the interplay between its various levels. On one level, it is seen as an embodied experience of Asia Minor refugees at the individual level that is mediated through familial, collective, cultural, and national frameworks of remembrance. The second level consists of collective memory shared by individuals within a group with shared memories, and the third level refers to cultural memory or the national narrative that concerns society as a whole (Gildea 2013:37-8).

Intergenerational memory

This intergenerational transmission of refugee memories will be elucidated by linking the structure of ‘postmemory’, which ‘is a *consequence* of traumatic recall but [...] at a generational remove’

(Hirsch 2008:106) and the model of ‘multidirectional memory’, which illustrates the ‘interaction of different historical memories’ (Rothberg 2009:3).

Specifically, the intergenerational component of postmemory is related to embodied experiences at the individual level and to their familial transfer from one generation to the next, while the transgenerational component encompasses national, political, and cultural memories and structures of mediation through which individuals articulate their lives. Through this perspective the interplay among multiple levels, sites, and agents of memory will be elucidated across generations. Changes across changing historical contexts will also be evaluated through the examination of the dynamic interaction of the echoes of different historical experiences that coexist within a society. For instance, how are the memories of the 1922-1924 Asia Minor forced displacement related to the memories of the arrival of the Greeks of Egypt, the Greeks of Istanbul, Cypriots, Pontic Greeks, Albanians, and the contemporary migrants and refugees.

Memory of trauma

According to Caruth, ‘trauma describes an overwhelming experience of sudden, or catastrophic events, in which the response to the event occurs in the often delayed, and uncontrolled repetitive occurrence of hallucinations and other intrusive phenomena’ (Caruth 1991:181). In order to elucidate the transmission mechanism of traumatic memory, given that ‘trauma is both the event and the memory of the event’ (Thomson 2015:18), I will base my theoretical framework on the conceptual tool of refugee memory as experienced directly and indirectly through its transfer from the first to the following generations. Political scientists, as well as psychologists and anthropologists, stress that identities shaped in the context of a traumatic historical moment can have a long-lasting and intergenerational effect. Specifically, Lupu and Peisakhin, investigating the mechanism of family transmission, conclude that memories and ‘identities are passed down

from the victims of the deportation to their descendants' (Lupu and Peisakhin 2017:836). Similarly, Hirschon, referring to the Asia Minor refugee memory, notes that 'its strength and persistence into the successive generations is impressive' (Hirschon 1989:17). Fassin and Rechtman, conceptualise the individual and collective imprint of trauma as 'a historical experience that that may have occurred decades, generations, or even centuries ago' (Fassin and Rechtman 2009:xi). Sometimes this indirect transmission has 'cumulative effects...of ongoing suffering' (McGlothlin 1984:417-27) and often happens in an unconscious and non-linear way (Suleiman 2002:277-95).

Identity

The idea of belonging: we - they

The extent to which memory and identity inform and construct each other, as well as the way memory is converted from experiential to inherited and dilutes or reawakens both ethnic or refugee identity over time, potentially informing the interaction between the native population and ethnic out-groups, will be central themes of my analysis.

I will base my analysis on the collective and individual identity of displacement as is shaped by both refugees and the native population. Multiple forms of identity, such as class, race, gender, and ethnicity, intersect in societies and create different processes and practices of identification. The identity of Asia Minor refugees was formed through the coexistence of multiple layers of religious, educational, economic, and cultural particularities. However, it should be noted that decisions that do not result from people's free will often cause difficulties in the identification process. Hirschon states that refugees are 'by definition minority groups ... that are distinguished from others according to criteria which are used by them and by outsiders to define an identity different from that of the host society' (Hirschon 1992:158). Kitromilides argues that refugees'

identification was shaped by the hostility of the native population (Kitromilides 2006:43). Indeed, the often orientalist perspective of the native population lies at characterisations such as ‘baptised in yogurt’ that stigmatised refugees for years. This sense of a separate identity has been consciously maintained across generations through family memories.

Historically formed subjectivities and contemporary attitudes: empathy and hostility

The attitudes of descendants of Asia Minor refugees will be explored through different levels of memory, different generations of memory, and different historical moments. Tracing the ambiguous relationship between memory, storytelling, and contemporary attitudes, the complex identities of these historically formed subjectivities will be unpacked in the depth of the different contexts in which individuals made sense of their past and reconstructed their stories. Examining the role of shared histories, Rothberg notes that ‘[i]t is often difficult to tell whether a given act of memory is more likely to produce competition or mutual understanding—sometimes both seem to happen simultaneously’ (Rothberg 2009:11).

Generation

In order to examine empirically the way refugee memory of primary migration is transferred from one generation to the next, the concept of generation, beyond linear and unproblematic definitions, will be one of the main analytical tools. The concept of generation, while seeming incontestable in a ‘family-oriented perspective’ of clear succession relationships, in a ‘theoretical perspective’ (Suleiman 2002:292) is a blurred concept whose complexity has been depicted by social philosopher Karl Mannheim’s work on *The Problem of Generations*. In my analysis, the internal diversity of people with refugee memories across generations will be demonstrated through Mannheim’s idea of generation as ‘related ‘age groups’ embedded in a historical-social process’

and as differentiated sub- generational units (Mannheim 1952:292). According to Suleiman, ‘what all of the attempts to define a historical generation have in common is the concept of shared or collective experience, which in turn influences collective behavior and attitudes’ (Suleiman 2002:280).

Conclusion

The narrative of the Asia Minor refugee memory is not static and passive, but is instead actively reshaped and contested over time. In this research, memory is seen as a dynamic oscillation between continuities and discontinuities of the past and the present, through which historically formed subjectivities will be unpacked in the context of Europe's contemporary ‘migration crisis’. The way the subjectivities of Asia Minor refugees and their descendants are shaped and reshaped across different generations of memory, across multiple levels – individual, collective, national – and across different historical periods – from the end of War World I to the post-Cold War period – will be elucidated through the fluid interplay between memory, storytelling, and contemporary attitudes. In this light, the nuanced relationship between memory and identity, the conceptual tools of this study, and the extent to which they inform and construct each other, creating different practices of belonging over time and potentially producing empathy or hostility, will be examined.

Bibliography

A2 Printed primary sources

Η Έξοδος. Τόμος Α'. Μαρτυρίες από τις Επαρχίες των Δυτικών Παραλίων της Μικρασίας [Exodus. Volume A'. Testimonies from the Provinces of the West Coast of Asia Minor], ed. F. D. Apostolopoulos (Athens, 1980)

Η Έξοδος. Τόμος Β'. Μαρτυρίες από τις Επαρχίες της Κεντρικής και Νότιας Μικρασίας [Exodus. Volume B'. Testimonies from the Provinces of Central and South Asia Minor], ed. G. Mourellos (Athens, 2004)

Η Έξοδος. Τόμος Γ'. Μαρτυρίες από τις Επαρχίες του Μεσόγειου Πόντου [Exodus. Volume C'. Testimonies from the Provinces of the Mediterranean Sea], ed. P. M. Kitromilides (Athens, 2013)

Η Έξοδος. Τόμος Δ'. Μαρτυρίες από τον Ανατολικό Παράλιο Πόντο [Exodus. Volume D'. Testimonies from the Eastern Paralia of Pontos], ed. P. M. Kitromilides (Athens, 2015)

Η Έξοδος. Τόμος Ε'. Μαρτυρίες από τον Δυτικό Παράλιο Πόντο και την Παφλαγονία [Exodus. Volume E'. Testimonies from the West Coast and Paphlagonia], ed. P. M. Kitromilides (Athens, 2016)

B1 Printed secondary works

Abrams, L., *Oral History Theory*, 1st edn (London, 2010)

Aktar, A., 'Homogenising the Nation, Turkifying the Economy', in R. Hirschon (ed), *Crossing the Aegean* (New York, 2003), pp. 79-96

Akgonul, S., 'Towards Minority Policies Beyond Reciprocity? The EU, Greece and Turkey', in O. Anastasakis, Kalypso Nicolaidis and Kerem Oktem (eds), *In the Long Shadow of Europe* (Leiden, 2009), pp. 191-218

Al-Rasheed, M., 'The Myth of Return: Iraqi Arab and Assyrian Refugees in London', *Journal of Refugee Studies*, 7/2-3 (1994), pp. 199-219

Anagnostopoulou, S., *Μικρά Ασία 19^{ος} αι. – 1919* [Asia Minor 19th Century – 1919], 1st edn (Athens, 2013)

Anastasakis, O., Nicolaidis, K., and Oktem, K., 'Introduction: The Long Shadow of Europe', in O. Anastasakis, Kalypso Nicolaidis and Kerem Oktem (eds), *In the Long Shadow of Europe* (Leiden, 2009), pp. 1-18

Balcells, L., 'The Consequences of Victimization on Political Identities', *Politics & Society*, 40/3 (2012), pp. 311-47

Berg, M. L. and Eckstein, S., 'Introduction: Reimagining Migrant Generations', *Diaspora*, 18/1 (2009), pp. 1-23

Caruth, C., 'Unclaimed Experience: Trauma and the Possibility of History', *Yale French Studies*, 79/1 (1991), pp. 181-92

Caruth, C., *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative and History*, 1st edn (Baltimore, 1996)

Clark, B., *Twice a Stranger: How Mass Expulsion Forged Modern Greece and Turkey* (London, 2007)

Clogg, R., *Minorities in Greece: Aspects of a Plural Society* (London, 2002)

Crane, S., 'Writing the Individual Back into Collective Memory', *American Historical Review*, 102/4 (1997), pp. 1372-85

Dinas, E. and Fouka, V., 'Family History and Attitudes Toward Outgroups: Evidence from the Syrian Refugee Crisis', in *SSRN Electronic Journal* (published online January 2018), doi: 10.2139/ssrn.3102093

Doumanis, N., *Before the Nation* (Oxford, 2012)

- Druker, J., 'Trauma and Latency in Primo Levi's the Reawakening', in R. Sodi and Millicent Marcus (eds), *New Reflections on Primo Levi* (New York, 2011), pp. 63-77
- Fresco, N., 'Remembering the Unknown', *International Review of Psycho-Analysis*, 11/4 (1984), pp. 417-27
- Freud, S., *Moses and Monotheism*, tr. K. Jones (London, 1939)
- Gildea, R., 'The Long March of Oral History: Around 1968 in France', *Oral History*, 38/1 (2010), pp. 68-80
- Gildea, R., 'Utopia and Conflict in the Oral Testimonies of French 1968 Activists', *Memory Studies*, 6/1 (2013), pp. 37-52
- Gildea, R. and Mark, J., 'Introduction', in R. Gildea, James Mark and Anette Warring (eds), *Europe's 1968: Voices of Revolt* (Oxford, 2013), pp. 1-18
- Green, A., 'Individual Remembering and Collective Memories: Theoretical Presuppositions and Contemporary Debates', *Oral History*, 32/2 (2004), pp. 35-44
- Gropas, R. and Triandafyllidou, A., 'Migration in Greece at a Glance', *Eliamep*, (2005), pp. 1-13
- Halbwachs, M., *The collective memory*, 1st edn (New York, 1980)
- Hirsch, M., 'The Generation of Postmemory', *Poetics Today*, 29/1 (2008)
- Hirschon, R., *Heirs of the Greek Catastrophe*, 1st edn (New York, 1989)
- Hirschon, R., 'Memory and Identity: The Asia Minor Greeks in Kokkinia', in E. Papataxiarchis (ed), *Anthropology and the Past: Contributions to Social History in Modern Greece* (Athens, 1992)
- Hirschon, R., 'Unmixing Peoples' in the Aegean Region', in R. Hirschon (ed), *Crossing the Aegean* (New York, 2003), pp. 3-12

Hirschon, R., 'History's Long Shadow: The Lausanne Treaty and Contemporary Greco-Turkish Relations', in O. Anastasakis, Kalypso Nicolaidis and Kerem Oktem (eds), *The Long Shadow of Europe* (Boston, 2009), pp. 73-94

Hutton, P. H., 'Sigmund Freud and Maurice Halbwachs: The Problem of Memory in Historical Psychology', *The History Teacher*, 27/2 (1994), pp. 145-58

Johnson, H. and Thompson, A., 'The Development and Maintenance of Post- Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD) in Civilian Adult Survivors of War Trauma and Torture: A Review', *Clinical psychology review*, 28/1 (2008), pp. 36-47

Kertzer, D. I., 'Generation as a Sociological Problem', *Annual Review of Sociology*, 9/1 (1983), pp. 125-49

Kitromilides, P. M., 'Contribution to the Study of the Asia Minor Tragedy: Evidence on the Destruction of the Hellenism of Bithynia', *Mikrasiatika Chronika*, 15/1 (1972), pp. 372-98

Kitromilides, P. M. and Alexandris, A., 'Ethnic Survival, Nationalism and Forced Migration: The Historical Demography of the Greek Community of Asia Minor at the Close of the Ottoman Era', *Bulletin of the Centre for Asia Minor Studies*, 5/1 (1984), pp. 9-44

Kitromilides, P. M., 'Imagined Communities' and the Origins of the National Question in the Balkans', *European History Quarterly*, 19/2 (1989), pp. 149-92

Kitromilides, P. M., 'Οι Ιδεολογικές Πτυχές του Προσφυγικού Φαινομένου' ['Ideological Aspects of the Refugee Phenomenon'], in A. Karapanou (ed), *Η Αττική Γη Υποδέχεται τους Πρόσφυγες '22* [The Attic Earth Receives the Refugees of '22] (Athens, 2006), pp. 35-43

Kitromilides, P. M., 'The End of Empires, the Asia Minor Catastrophe and the Ecumenical Patriarchy', *Bulletin of the Centre for Asia Minor Studies*, 17/1 (2011), pp. 29-42

Koliopoulos, G., *Plundered Loyalties: Axis Occupation and Civil Strife in Greek West Macedonia, 1941-1949* (London, 1999)

Kondoglou, F., *Το Αϊβαλί Η Πατρίδα μου* [Aivali My Homeland] (Athens, 1962)

- Kontogiorgi, E., 'Economic Consequences Following Refugee Settlement in Greek Macedonia, 1923–1932', in R. Hirschon (ed), *Crossing the Aegean* (New York, 2003), pp. 63-78
- Kostis, K., 'The Ideology of Economic Development', *Bulletin of the Centre of Asia Minor Studies*, 9/1 (1992), pp. 31-46
- Koufopoulou, S., 'Muslim Cretans in Turkey: The Reformulation of Ethnic Identity in an Aegean Community', in R. Hirschon (ed), *Crossing the Aegean* (New York, 2003), pp. 209-20
- Ladas, S. P., *The Exchange of Minorities: Bulgaria, Greece and Turkey* (New York, 1932)
- Loizos, P., 'Ottoman Half-Lives: Long-Term Perspectives on Particular Forced Migrations', *Journal of Refugee Studies*, 12/3 (1999), pp. 237-63
- Lupu, N. and Peisakhin, L., 'The Legacy of Political Violence Across Generations', *American Journal of Political Science*, 61/4 (2017), pp. 836-51
- Mackridge, P. and Yannakakis, E., *Ourselves and Others: The Development of a Greek Macedonian Cultural Identity since 1912* (Oxford, 1997)
- Mannheim, K., 'The Problem of Generations', in P. Kecskemeti (ed), *Essays on the Sociology of Knowledge* (London, 1952), pp. 276-320
- Mavrogordatos, G. T., *Stillborn republic: Social coalitions and party strategies in Greece, 1922-1936* (London, 1983)
- Mazower, M., *Greece and the Inter-War Economic Crisis* (Oxford, 1991)
- Mazower, M., 'The Refugees, the Economic Crisis and the Collapse of Venizelist Hegemony, 1929-1932', *Bulletin of the Centre for Asia Minor Studies*, 9/1 (1992), pp. 119-34
- Mazower, M., *Dark Continent* (London, 1998)
- Mazower, M., *Salonica, City of Ghosts* (London, 2005)
- McGlothlin, E., *Second-Generation Holocaust Literature* (Rochester, 2006)

Michaels, W. B., 'Plots Against America: Neoliberalism and Antiracism', *American Literary History*, 18/2 (2006), pp. 288–302

Myrivilis, S., *Ο Βασίλης ο Αρβανίτης* [Vasilis Arvanitis] (Athens, 1943)

Nissani, M. 'Ten Cheers for Interdisciplinarity: The Case for Interdisciplinary Knowledge and Research', *The Social Sciences Journal*, 34/2 (1997), pp. 201-216

Nora, P. and Kritzman, L. D., *Realms of Memory: Rethinking the French Past*, 1st edn (1 vol, New York, 1996)

Pallis, A. A., 'Racial Migrations in the Balkans during the Years 1912-1924', *The Geographical Journal*, 66/4 (1925), pp. 315-31

Paluck, E. L. and Green, D. P., 'Prejudice Reduction: What Works? A Review and Assessment of Research and Practice', *Annual Review of Psychology*, 60/1 (2009), pp. 339-67

Passerini, L., 'Work Ideology and Consensus Under Italian Fascism', *History Workshop Journal*, 8/1 (1979), pp. 82-108

Pentzopoulos, D., *The Balkan Exchange of Minorities and its Impact on Greece*, 1st edn (Paris, 1962)

Petropoulou, I., 'The Ideological Path of Melpo Merlie, the Centre for Asia Minor Studies and the Formation of the Archive of Oral Tradition', in A. Mpoutzouvi (ed), *Testimonials on Audio and Visual Impressions as a Source of History* (Athens, 1998), pp. 117-32

Portelli, A., *The Death of Luigi Trastulli and Other Stories*, 1st edn (Albany, 1991)

Roper, M., 'Analysing the Analysed: Transference and Counter-Transference in the Oral History Encounter', *Oral History*, 31/2 (2003), pp. 20-32

Rothberg, M., *Multidirectional Memory: Remembering the Holocaust in the Age of Decolonization* (Stanford, 2009)

Salamone, S. D., *In the Shadow of the Holy Mountain*, 1st edn (New York, 1987)

- Schützenberger, A. A., *The Ancestor Syndrome* (London, 1998)
- Smith, M. L., *Ionian Vision: Greece in Asia Minor, 1919-1922*, 1st edn (London, 1973)
- Sotiriou, D., *Ματωμένα Χώματα* [Farewell Anatolia] (Athens, 1962)
- Sotiriou, D., *Οι Νεκροί Περιμένουν* [The dead are waiting] (Athens, 1979)
- Spitzer, A. B., 'The Historical Problem of Generations', *The American Historical Review*, 78/5 (1973), pp. 1353-85
- Stelaku, V., 'Space, Place and Identity: Memory and Religion in Two Cappadocian Greek Settlements', in R. Hirschon (ed), *Crossing the Aegean* (New York, 2003), pp. 179-92
- Suleiman, S. R., 'The 1.5 Generation: Thinking about Child Survivors and the Holocaust', *American Imago*, 59/3 (2002), pp. 277-95
- Tansug, F., 'Memory and Migration: The Turkish Experience of the Compulsory Population Exchange', *Bulletin of the Centre for Asia Minor Studies*, 17/1 (2011), pp. 195-215
- Tata Arsel, L., *Με το Διωγμό στην Ψυχή* [Relocation on their Soul], (Athens, 2014)
- Thomson, A. 'Memory and Remembering in Oral History', in D. Ritchie (ed), *The Oxford Handbook of Oral History* (Oxford, 2010), p. 78-91
- Thomson, A., 'Anzac Memories Revisited: Trauma, Memory and Oral History', *The Oral History Review*, 42/1 (2015), pp. 1-29.
- Thompson, P. R., *The Voice of the Past*, 4th edn (Oxford, 2017)
- Triandafyllidou, A., 'Turning the Refugee Crisis into an Opportunity?: Current Challenges for Greece and Suggestions for Action', *European University Institute*, 2015/2 (2015), pp. 1-11
- Tsimouris, G., 'From Christian Romioi to Hellenes: Some Reflections on Nationalism and the Transformation of Greek Identity in Asia Minor', *Bulletin of the Centre for Asia Minor Studies*, 17 (2011), pp. 277-97

Venezis, I., *To Noumero 31328* [Number 31328] (Athens, 1931)

Venezis, I., *Αιολική Γη* [Aeolian Earth] (Athens, 1943)

Veremis, T., '1922: Political Continuities and Realignments in the Greek State', in R. Hirschon (ed), *Crossing the Aegean* (New York, 2003), pp. 53-62

Vergeti, M., 'Pontic Greeks from Asia Minor and the Soviet Union: Problems of Integration into Modern Greece', *Journal of Refugee Studies*, 4/4 (1991), pp. 340-56

Vescio, T., Sechrist, G., and Paolucci, M., 'Perspective taking and prejudice reduction: The mediational role of empathy arousal and situational attributions', *European Journal of Social Psychology*, 33/4 (2003), pp. 455-72

Vollhardt, J. R., 'Collective Victimization', *Oxford Handbook of Intergroup Conflict* (Oxford, 2012), pp. 136-57

Voutira, E., 'Pontic Greeks Today: Migrants or Refugees?', *Journal of Refugee Studies*, 4/4 (1991), pp. 400-20

Voutira, E., 'When Greeks Meet Other Greeks: Settlement Policy Issues in the Contemporary Greek Context', in R. Hirschon (ed), *Crossing the Aegean* (New York, 2003), pp. 145-157

Weissman, G., *Fantasies of Witnessing*, 1st edn (Ithaca, 2004)

Wittenberg, J., *Crucibles of Political Loyalty*, 1st edn (Cambridge, 2006)

Zetter, R., 'Labelling Refugees: Forming and Transforming a Bureaucratic Identity', *Journal of Refugee Studies*, 4/1 (1991), pp. 39-62

Zetter, R., 'The Greek-Cypriot Refugees: Perceptions of Return Under Conditions of Protracted Exile', *The International Migration Review*, 28/2 (1994), pp. 302-20

Zetter, R., 'Reconceptualising the Myth of Return: Protracted Exile and the Greek Cypriot Refugees', *Journal of Refugee Studies*, 12/1 (1999), pp. 1-22

Zetter, R., *Lands of no Return: Population Exchange and Forced Displacement in the 20th Century* (Athens, 2012)

B3 Websites

The UN Refugee Agency, 'Greece' (22 June 2018), <https://www.unhcr.org/greece.html> (3 Feb. 2019).

**The Impact of Immigration on Growth and Vice Versa.
An empirical analysis of the Greek case from 1998 to 2017.**

Anastasia Blouchoutzi, PhD Candidate, Department of International and European Studies,
University of Macedonia, Thessaloniki, Greece

Abstract

In the aftermath of the recent migration and economic crises, Greece, as well as other European Union member states, has been facing questions such as whether immigration is advantageous for their economies or whether the benefits of immigration outweigh its fiscal cost.

This paper examines whether Okun's law is valid in the case of immigrant population in Greece and presents the "immigration surplus", that is the economic benefits the native population receives due to immigration. As such, the focus of this paper is to relate immigration in Greece with growth.

The empirical analysis of the Greek case from 1998 to 2017 demonstrates that the unemployment of the immigrants is more responsive to GDP growth than the unemployment of the natives with a ratio of 1.56-to-1. Moreover, the size of "immigration surplus" varies between 0.02% and 0.12% of GDP and is indicative of the dynamics of a targeted immigration policy.

Introduction

The recent migration inflows to EU member states have become a controversial and challenging issue for the European leaders. Almost 2 million people entered the European Union borders since 2014 (UNHCR 2019), bringing matters as the management of immigration and social inclusion to the fore. Furthermore, due to the recent European debt crisis, there is also an ongoing debate on the benefits of immigration against its fiscal cost.

The purpose of this paper is to relate immigration in Greece with growth. In this framework, Okun's law is tested to indicate the unemployment- output relationship in the case of the immigrant population in Greece. Moreover, this paper examines the benefits of immigration as regards the native's earnings. Using a simple economic framework, previously presented by Borjas (1995), the percentage GDP growth stemmed from immigration in Greece is calculated.

The remainder of this paper is structured in five chapters including a brief description of the Greek migration history and economic crisis, a short literature review, the empirical study divided in two parts and the conclusion which wraps up the analysis.

Migration and the economic crisis in Greece

Initially, the major emigrant outflows from Greece occurred in the early 1830s, and then, after World War II. In both of these cases, economic forces and political factors were the main causes. Following the oil crises and the restrictive immigration policies European countries adopted, there was also a repatriation wave in the late 1970s and the early 1980s (Christodoulou and Nikas 2012). However, due to the economic crisis and the pessimistic expectations of the economy during the recent recession period, native Greeks created once again a negative migration balance (Cavounidis 2013).

Besides the Greek emigration history, the country has also experienced immigration which lately has become increasingly widespread. There were two major peaks in the immigrant inflows in Greece. The first one occurred after the fall of the communist system and the second one after the Syrian civil war began. This, more recent, immigration outbreak coincided though with the Greek economic crisis.

In 2008, Greece entered a period of deep recession. The Greek economic crisis was connected to structural weaknesses but also the implications of the country's entrance to the monetary union (Michail 2013). From 2008-2015 the country's GDP dropped by 23% and the unemployment rate reached a peak of 27.5%. Moreover, there were major downturns in the average household income, consumption and gross fixed capital formation. As a result, Greece requested a bailout package from the EU and the IMF. This came along with several austerity measures which deepened the recession (Giglioli 2017). Under economic turmoil though, the public interest towards immigration is more intense as there is competition for scarce job and social provisions and countries tend to respond reactively by adopting more restrictive immigration policies (Dimitrakopoulou and Kontis 2016).

Most of the immigrant population in Greece used to work in the construction sector, as it is presented in Table 1. The numbers of the immigrant employees in household employment were more than double compared with those of the natives, as the immigrant female population was mainly concentrated on household services. Native Greeks were mainly occupied in the tertiary sector of the economy and a big part of them in agriculture.

Table 1. Worker's employment per sector and citizenship (thousands)

Sector	Manufacturing		Agriculture		Commerce		Hospitality and Food Industry		Construction		Households	
	IM	NAT	IM	NAT	IM	NAT	IM	NAT	IM	NAT	IM	NAT
2008	49.3	489.3	16.1	494.8	32.0	800.5	29.8	284.8	110.5	271.7	43.7	20.4
2009	59.1	453.7	26.9	500.2	37.4	781.7	38.9	269.6	107.0	248.2	53.6	22.4
2010	48.0	413.8	30.8	507.0	44.8	747.3	38.3	258.1	88.1	221.0	52.6	21.9
2011	37.1	367.6	28.7	464.6	43.0	702.7	37.7	249.5	63.5	171.7	42.9	14.9
2012	29.2	317.1	28.7	445.6	31.2	624.2	34.7	231.3	43.3	149.3	33.3	13.0
2013	20.9	298.4	25.8	448.5	30.1	592.6	30.6	220.7	36.1	122.3	31.4	11.8
2014	23.4	287.5	24.7	448.9	35.0	585.0	34.1	252.4	35.5	111.6	30.2	10.5
2015	22.2	307.5	25.6	434.2	34.9	621.5	34.4	283.1	27.0	114.1	25.7	14.8
2016	23.0	321.5	26.6	422.4	30.6	622.5	35.0	299.7	24.5	119.0	20.2	15.0
2017	23.4	330.7	22.1	426.2	27.2	647.6	34.4	309.4	24.7	121.5	16.2	14.5

Source: Hellenic Statistical Authority 2018

The recession increased inter-sector mobility among immigrant workers as they sought new employment opportunities. Nevertheless, the crisis which affected the real estate and housing market destabilized the immigrant households. For example, the number of the construction workers dropped dramatically from 110,500 to 24,500 (-78%). The number of the immigrants working in manufacturing and households was dropped by 50%. Immigrant employment in commerce, agriculture and the hospitality and food businesses had less change. Currently, the biggest part of the immigrant employees concentrates on hospitality services, the food industry and commerce.

State of the Art

Okun's law has been revisited with regard to Greece. However, the emphasis of this paper is on Okun's coefficient for the immigrants, an issue that hasn't been pointed out. Apergis and Rezitis (2010) have estimated Okun's relationship between 1960 and 1997 for certain regional areas, finding a structural change in the responsiveness of unemployment to output changes after 1981. Christopoulos (2004) also applied the law at a regional level, confirming the relationship in 6 out of 13 Greek regions. Karfakis *et al.* (2014) have more recently tested the validity of the output- unemployment relationship for the period 2000-2012, suggesting a 3:1 ratio.

In a general framework of OECD, European or Mediterranean countries, the aforementioned relationship has also been examined for Greece, by Moazzami and Dadgostar (2009), Blazquez-Fernandez *et al.* (2018) and Perman and Tavera (2007) respectively. On the other hand, Rigas *et al.* (2011) and Koutroulis *et al.* (2016) examined thoroughly the implementation of the law, calibrating the model to the structural differences and specific characteristics of the Greek economy.

Furthermore, Okun's law has been studied with regard to gender differences. Zanin (2014) investigated estimates for male and female age cohorts in OECD countries. Bod'a and Povazanova (2015) established minimal different responses of male and female unemployment to output changes in Greece. Brincikova and Darmo (2015) also suggested that the sensitivity of male and female unemployment to output changes is more similar in countries with lower economic performance, as in Greece.

As regards the influential work of Borjas and his concept of "immigration surplus", there is plenty of research built on it, like Altonji and Card (1991), Peri and Ottaviano (2005), Drinkwater *et al.* (2007) and Ben-Gad (2008) pointing out various aspects of the immigration impact on the labour market of the host country.

To the best of our knowledge, there is no other paper to analyse longitudinal data in the case of Greece. However, there are several papers searching for the impact of immigration on native workers. Chassamboulli and Palivos (2013) allowed for skill heterogeneity and differential unemployment income between immigrants and natives and supported that skilled natives gain from immigration in terms of employment and wages. Chletsos and Roupakias (2012) studied the direction of causality between migration and two macroeconomic variables, real GDP and unemployment, and though they detected that GDP growth as well as unemployment Granger cause migration, there was no evidence for the reverse causality. Dritsakis (2008) also examined the causal relationship between migration and economic growth, revealing a long run bidirectional causality.

Furthermore, there is also relevant literature about the "immigration surplus" for other European countries. Amuedo-Dorantes and De la Rica (2013) assessing the impact of immigration in Spain, showed that the amount of the immigrant surplus is larger when considering for the imperfect substitutability between immigrant and native workers. The benefits of migration are pointed out for the Visegrad group countries too, by the empirical research of Bilan and Strielkowski (2016). Last but not least, Kim *et al.* (2010) focusing on the UK labour market recommended that migration increases the world growth rate except from the case of unskilled migration.

Empirics

A) Immigrants' unemployment and output growth in Greece

For the purpose of this paper, the growth rate form of Okun's Law, or else the difference version, is used, assuming that the economy is in a steady state position where all markets are clear. Thus, the changes in the unemployment rate display changes from the natural level, while output grows in a constant rate. The variables of the model are the unemployment rate of the foreign population in Greece and the natural logarithm of real GDP and include quarterly data for the years 1998-2017, available from the Eurostat database (2019), which are adjusted for seasonality.

The main argument of Okun's law is that shifts in aggregate demand cause movements in real output which in turn lead firms to demand labour, thus reducing unemployment. Such a relationship is expressed by: $\Delta UN_t = a + b\Delta LGDP_t + e_t$. Moreover, a dynamic version of the law is derived when adding to the previous specification the lagged values of unemployment rate and output.

The Phillips and Perron unit root test indicates that both LGDP and UN series contain a unit root and they are not stationary processes. They are stationary in their first differences. Moreover, the relationship of the two variables is analysed using cross-correlation analysis, which portrayed that the GDP growth leads the changes in the unemployment rate by 5 quarters and their relationship is countercyclical.

Table 2. Unit Root Test

Variables	Phillips Perron t-test statistic	Test critical Value 5% level
UN	-0.539767	-2.898623
ΔUN	-7.537435	-2.899115
LGDP	-1.358018	-2.898623
$\Delta LGDP$	-7.281548	-2.899115

Afterwards, the time series is analysed using an ARDL model which is more efficient with a small sample size. Although the ARDL model approach could be used without first searching for unit roots, the variables were tested for stationarity to make sure that no series is integrated of order 2, I(2). The maximum lag length is set up at 6 and the Akaike Information Criteria determines that 6 lags are necessary for the dependent variable and 5 for GDP growth. The model also includes two dummies, a crash dummy variable for 2009Q1 and another one, depicting the wide fluctuations of ΔUN after 2015Q2.

Table 3. Estimated ARDL Model

Variable	Coefficient	Std. Error	t-Statistic	Prob.*
$\Delta UN(-1)$	0.055381	0.104837	0.528256	0.5993
$\Delta UN(-2)$	-0.005712	0.100923	-0.056597	0.9551
$\Delta UN(-3)$	-0.075925	0.088021	-0.862587	0.3919
$\Delta UN(-4)$	0.539936	0.087157	6.194993	0.0000

$\Delta UN(-5)$	-0.283181	0.110010	-2.574132	0.0126
$\Delta UN(-6)$	-0.519433	0.107616	-4.826742	0.0000
$\Delta LGDP$	-0.129666	0.115686	-1.120845	0.2670
$\Delta LGDP(-1)$	-0.201138	0.104610	-1.922744	0.0594
$\Delta LGDP(-2)$	-0.254573	0.110068	-2.312876	0.0243
$\Delta LGDP(-3)$	0.064173	0.114608	0.559936	0.5777
$\Delta LGDP(-4)$	0.008035	0.112538	0.071396	0.9433
$\Delta LGDP(-5)$	-0.311145	0.115055	-2.704319	0.0090
DUM	-1.261750	0.415608	-3.035911	0.0036
DUM09Q1	0.356296	1.257945	0.283236	0.7780
C	0.452850	0.164766	2.748439	0.0080

Included observations=73 after adjustments, R-squared=0.821644, F-statistic=19.08511

The diagnostic tests indicate that there is no serial correlation, heteroskedasticity or functional misspecification and the residuals are distributed normally. Table 4. presents the results of the Bounds test, which unveil whether there is a long run relationship between the two variables.

Table 4. Bounds Test

Significance	I(0) bound	I(1) Bound
2.5%	5.77	6.68
5%	4.94	5.73
10%	4.04	4.78
F-statistic: 17.10130		

The computed F statistic is greater than the upper bound I(1) whether compared with the critical values of Pesaran et al. (2001) or Narayan (2005), so the null hypothesis is rejected and the Error Correction Model is specified. Hence, the long run relationship of the two variables receives the following form:

$$\Delta UN = - 0.6395 \Delta LGDP + -0.9789 DUM + 0.2764 DUM09Q1 + 0.3513$$

The long run coefficient is indicative of a long term negative and significant (p-value= 0.0000) relationship between changes in unemployment and GDP growth. It shows a ratio of 1.56:1, that is, every 1% decrease in the unemployment rate of immigrants is connected to a 1.56% GDP growth. Therefore, the unemployment of immigrants is far more responsive to GDP growth than the natives' which is usually represented by the general 3:1 ratio. The cointegration coefficient which receives a value between -1 and -2 (CointEq(1): -1.288934, p-value: 0.0000) portrays that convergence is achieved in a decreasingly fluctuating form (Narayan and Smith 2006). The short run coefficients are also significant, though positive, as it is presented in Table 5.

Table 5. Short run Coefficients

Variable	Coefficient	Std. Error	t-Statistic	Prob.
$\Delta(\Delta\text{UN}(-1))$	0.344314	0.206207	1.669755	0.1004
$\Delta(\Delta\text{UN}(-2))$	0.338603	0.197409	1.715231	0.0916
$\Delta(\Delta\text{UN}(-3))$	0.262677	0.163268	1.608868	0.1131
$D(\Delta\text{UN}(-4))$	0.802613	0.130924	6.130380	0.0000
$\Delta(D\text{UN}(-5))$	0.519433	0.107616	4.826742	0.0000
$\Delta(\Delta\text{LGDP}1)$	-0.129666	0.115686	-1.120845	0.2670
$\Delta(\Delta\text{LGDP}1(-1))$	0.254573	0.110068	2.312876	0.0243
$\Delta(\Delta\text{LGDP}1(-2))$	-0.064173	0.114608	-0.559936	0.5777
$\Delta(\Delta\text{LGDP}1(-3))$	-0.008035	0.112538	-0.071396	0.9433
$\Delta(\Delta\text{LGDP}1(-4))$	0.311145	0.115055	2.704319	0.0090
$\Delta(D\text{UM})$	-1.261750	0.415608	-3.035911	0.0036
$\Delta(D\text{UM}1)$	0.356296	1.257945	0.283236	0.7780
CointEq(-1)	-1.288934	0.220486	-5.845865	0.0000

There is also a short run causal effect according to the Pairwise Granger causality tests which depicts that the past values of GDP growth help predicting the future values of the changes in unemployment.

B) Immigration surplus in Greece

Borjas (1995) tried to shed light on the benefits which natives receive due to immigration in the USA and established that the short run immigration surplus is on the order of 0,1% of the US GDP. Emphasizing on the production complementarities between immigrant workers and other factors of production, he provided evidence that natives do benefit from immigration.

For the purpose of Borjas' study, the following assumptions have been made:

- a single consumption good is produced
- the elasticities of capital and labor supply is 0
- all workers are substitutes in production
- natives own the capital
- the negative impact of immigration on the wage is spread over the entire economy
- there is no structural unemployment

The calculation formula for the immigration surplus as a fraction of national income based on the aforementioned simple economic model which Borjas used is:

$$\Delta Q_n/Q = -\frac{1}{2} * s * e * m^2,$$

where: s=labor's share of national income,

e=elasticity of factor price for labor,

m=foreign-born fraction of the labour force.

In the case of Greece, half of the total national income is paid as employee compensation. As for the elasticity of factor price for labor, assuming a Cobb-Douglas production function, it is derived as follows: $e=s-1$. Labour force, in this study, refers to the fraction of working age population 15-64 years old. The data are available from the ILOSTAT (2019) and Eurostat (2019) webpages.

Following Borjas' calculations, it should be noted that the aforementioned methodology is a static one, used for small temporary immigrant inflows. Therefore, it does

not account for the immigrant stock and the adjustment of the capital over the years. However, the implementation of such a simple model, though it may not capture the exact quantitative effect of immigration in Greece but rather the upper limits of it, it could still provide us with useful policy suggestions on the benefits of immigration on growth.

Using longitudinal data for Greece from 1998-2017, this study suggests that the immigration surplus in Greece varies between 0.02% and 0.12% of GDP. Though it seems as a small amount, considering the absolute values it is between 22 and 283 million €. It reached a peak in 2009-2010 when the labor share of income and the foreign born fraction of the workforce in the country received their largest values. This is attributable to the fact that during these years, in the aftermath of the global financial crisis and the beginning of Greek government-debt crisis, the total active labor force in Greece started to decrease due to the flea of many Greek emigrants abroad to search for better job opportunities.

Table 6. Immigration Surplus in Greece

Year	Immigration Surplus % GDP	Immigration Surplus (€)
1998	0.02	22,619,278.15
1999	0.02	25,706,708.21
2000	0.02	23,672,898.77
2001	0.02	35,007,000.69
2002	0.04	59,382,056.10
2003	0.04	77,009,449.29
2004	0.05	101,961,359.57
2005	0.06	116,348,839.86
2006	0.06	121,097,226.24
2007	0.06	150,913,491.26
2008	0.08	204,018,257.33
2009	0.12	283,459,965.86
2010	0.12	270,377,749.23
2011	0.11	219,838,908.82
2012	0.10	184,640,804.59
2013	0.09	162,637,650.85
2014	0.09	157,054,172.95
2015	0.07	119,858,750.81

2016	0.06	101,182,734.99
2017	0.05	85,434,072.08

This “textbook” model, as Borjas mentions it (2006: 10), illustrates the plausible dynamics of immigration in the case of the Greek labour market. It also stimulates the assessment of the advantages of immigrants’ presence, so as the appropriate labour market integration policies is implemented, considering that the immigration surplus is zero when immigrants replicate the existing economy.

Conclusion

In a period when immigration in Europe has been questioned, this paper unveils the relationship of immigration with growth for Greece between 2008 and 2017. Apart from the immigrant flows in the country during the aforementioned period, which peaked in 2015, Greece has also faced a deep economic recession that altered its labour market. However, the economically rational response towards immigration is the successful labour market integration.

This paper provides evidence that immigration could be beneficial for the native population in Greece following a targeted immigration policy which would attract immigrants with complementary skills to the natives’. The results of this study offer indication that the immigration surplus in Greece varies between 0.02% and 0.12% of GDP, which obviously portrays a dynamics, if anything beneficial, for the revitalization of the Greek economy.

Moreover, the econometric survey of Okun’s law using available data for the immigrants in Greece, demonstrates a relationship between GDP and unemployment on the order of 1.56:1 contrary to the 3:1 general ratio. Thus, it supports that boosting Greek economy towards growth and overcoming its structural weaknesses is essential to promote labour market integration of immigrants.

After all, employment is usually the single most important determinant of a migrant’s net fiscal contribution. On that account, the challenge for drastic policy measures to facilitate the labour market integration of the newly arrived immigrants and their social inclusion has become urgent for Greece.

Bibliography

Altonji, G. J., and Card, D. (1991). ‘The Effects of Immigration on the Labor Market Outcomes of Less-skilled Natives, in Immigration, Trade, and the Labor Market’ in J. M. Abowd and R. B. Freeman (ed.), *Immigration, Trade, and the Labor Market*, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 201--31

Amuedo- Dorantes, C., and De la Rica, S. (2013). ‘The immigration surplus and the substitutability of immigrant and native labor: evidence from Spain’, *Empirical Economics*, 44:2, 945--58

Apergis, N., and Rezitis, A. (2003). ‘An examination of Okun's law: evidence from regional areas in Greece’, *Applied Economics*, 35:10, 1147--151

Ben-Gad, M. (2008). 'Capital-skill complementarity and the immigration surplus', *Review of Economic Dynamics*, 11, 335--65

Bilan, Y. and Strielkowski, W. (2016). 'Migration in post-transition economies: immigration surplus in Visegrad group countries', *International Journal of Trade and Global Markets*, 9:2, 182--96

Blau, D. F., and Mackie. C., eds. (2017). *The Economic and Fiscal Consequences of Immigration*. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press.

Blázquez-Fernández, C., Cantarero-Prieto, D., and Pascual-Sáez, M. (2018). 'Okun's Law in Selected European Countries (2005-2017): An Age and Gender Analysis', *Economics and Sociology*, 11:2, 263--74.

Bod'a, M. and Povazanova, M. (2015). 'Gender Asymmetry in Okun's Law in the Four PIGS Countries', *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 30, 111--23

Borjas, G. (1995). 'The Economic Benefits from Immigration', *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 9:2, 3--22

Borjas, G. (2006). 'The Impact of Immigration on the Labour Market'. Paper prepared for the Conference on Labor and Capital Flows in Europe Following Enlargement, 30-31/1/2006, Poland.

Cavounidis, J. (2013) 'Migration and the Economic and Social Landscape of Greece', *South-Eastern Europe Journal of Economics*, 1, 59--78.

Chassamboulli, A. and Palivos, T. (2013). 'The impact of immigration on the employment and wages of native workers', *Journal of Macroeconomics*, 39, 19--34

Chletsos, M. and Roupakias, S. (2012). 'Immigration, Unemployment and Growth: Empirical Evidence from Greece'. Munich Personal RePEch Archive Paper 39927

Christodoulou, D. and Nikas, C. (2012). *International Economics in the globalization era*. Athens: Epikentro.

Christopoulos, D. K. (2004). 'The relationship between output and unemployment: Evidence from Greek regions', *Papers in Regional Science*, 83:3, 611--20.

Dimitrakopoulou, F. and Kontis, A. (2016). 'Financial Crisis and Greek Immigration Policy'. Paper presented at the International Conference in Contemporary Social Sciences "Crisis and the Social Sciences: New Challenges and Perspectives", 10-12/6/2016, Rethymno, Greece.

Drinkwater, S., Levin, P., Lotti, E. and Pearlman, J. (2007). 'The immigration surplus revisited in a general equilibrium model with endogenous growth', *Journal of Regional Science*, 47:3, 569--601.

Dritsaki, C. and Dritsakis, N. (2009). 'Okun's coefficient for four Mediterranean Member Countries of EU: An empirical study', *International Journal of Business and Management*, 4:5, 18--26

Dritsakis, N. (2008). 'Immigration and Economic Growth: Further Evidence from Greece', *Applied Economics and Policy Analysis*, 2, 207--13

European Commission Directorate General for Economic and Financial Affairs (2016). 'An Economic Take on the Refugee Crisis', *European Economy Institutional Paper 033*, Brussels

Eurostat. (2019). *Labour Force Survey*. Luxembourg: European Commission, available at <https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat> (accessed 27 March 2019)

Giglioli, I. (2017). 'Migration, Austerity and Crisis at the Periphery of Europe'. Paper presented at the Othering and Belonging Conference, Haas Institute for a fair and inclusive society, University of California, 30/4/2017-2/5/2017, Berkeley, USA.

Hellenic Statistical Authority. (2018). *Annual Labour Force Survey*. Athens: Hellenic Statistical Authority, available at <http://www.statistics.gr/el/statistics/-/publication/SJO03/> (accessed 10/3/2018)

ILOSTAT. (2019). *Earnings and Labour Cost. Labour Income Share*. Geneva: International Labour Organization, available at <https://www.ilo.org/ilostat> (accessed 27 March 2019)

IMF. (2016). 'The Refugee Surge in Europe: Economic Challenges', *IMF Staff Discussion Note*, January 2016.

Karfakis, C., Katrakylidis, C., and Tsanana, E. (2013). 'Does Output Predict Unemployment? A look at Okun's Law in Greece', *Discussion Paper No. 1*, Department of Economics, University of Macedonia.

Kim, Y-B., Levine, P., and Lotti, E. (2010). 'Migration, Skill Composition and Growth', *National Institute Economic Review*, 213:1, R5--R19.

Koutroulis, A., Panagopoulos, Y. and Tsouma, E. (2016). 'Asymmetry in the response of unemployment to output changes in Greece: Evidence from hidden co-integration', *The Journal of Economic Asymmetries*, 13, 81--8.

Michail, D. (2013). 'Social Development and transnational households: resilience and motivation for Albanian immigrants in Greece in the era of economic crisis', *Southeast European and Black Sea Studies*, 132, 265--79.

Moazzami, B., and Dadgostar, B. (2009). 'Okun's Law Revisited: Evidence From OECD Countries', *International Business and Economics Research Journal*, 8:8, 21--4.

Narayan, P. (2005). 'The Saving and Investment Nexus for China: Evidence from Cointegration tests', *Applied Economics*, 37:17, 1979--90.

Narayan, P. and Smyth, R. (2006). 'What Determines Migration Flows from Low-Income to High-Income Countries? An Empirical Investigation of Fiji-U.S. Migration 1972-2001', *Contemporary Economic Policy*, 24:2,332--42

Okun, A. (1970). *The Political Economy of Prosperity*. New York: Norton.

Peri, G., and Ottaviano, I.P. G. (2005). 'Rethinking the Gains from Immigration: Theory and Evidence from the U.S.', Working Paper No. 05-8, University of California, Department of Economics, Davis, CA.

Perman, R., and Tavera, C. (2007). 'Testing for convergence of Okun's coefficient in Europe', *Empirica*, 34:1, 45--61.

Rigas, J., Theodosiou, G., Rigas, N., and Blanas, G. (2011). 'The validity of the Okun's law: an empirical investigation for the Greek economy', *Journal of European Economy*, 10:1, 16--38.

UNHCR. (2019). 'Mediterranean Situation', Operational Data Portal, available at <https://data2.unhcr.org/en/situations/mediterranean> (accessed 30 March 2019)

Zanin, L. (2014). 'On Okun's law in OECD countries: An analysis by age cohorts', *Economics Letters*, 125:2, 243--48