MAPPING OF VET POLICIES AND PRACTICES FOR SOCIAL INCLUSION AND SOCIAL COHESION IN THE WESTERN BALKANS, TURKEY AND ISRAEL

Tel Aviv, Israel, 11 - 13 November 2013
Cross-country analysis

Will Bartlett (LSE)
Claire Gordon (LSE)
Marina Cino-Pagliarelli (LSE)
Simona Milio (LSE Enterprise)
Outline of Presentation

1. Aims and Methodology

2. Overview and key findings
   • Policy framework
   • Entry into school: selection and choice
   • Experience at school
   • Dropping out
   • The transition from education to work
   • Social cohesion

3. Conclusions and Recommendations
Aims and Methodology

• To understand the barriers and opportunities for building inclusive and equitable VET systems in the Western Balkans, Turkey and Israel

• To provide new evidence on the role of VET in combating social exclusion and contributing to more cohesive societies

• **Methods** included a combination of qualitative and quantitative methods:
  • Interviews and focus groups
  • student and teacher surveys
VET Policy Orientations

- VET Strategies that emphasize social inclusion and social cohesion
  - Macedonia, Montenegro, Serbia

- VET Strategies that emphasize adjustment to labour market
  - Albania, BiH, Croatia, Israel, Kosovo, Turkey
Similar school systems...

Turkey
- Pre-school: 6
- Primary education: 5
- Lower secondary 2A: 3
- Upper secondary 3A: 4

Macedonia
- Pre-school: 6
- Primary education: 5
- Lower secondary 2A: 4
- Upper secondary 3A: 4

Serbia
- Pre-school: 7
- Primary education: 4
- Lower secondary 2A: 4
- Upper secondary 3A: 4

Montenegro
- Pre-school: 6
- Primary education: 5
- Lower secondary 2A: 4
- Upper secondary 3A: 4

Croatia
- Pre-school: 7
- Primary education: 4
- Lower secondary 2A: 4
- Upper secondary 3A: 4

Bosnia
- Pre-school: 6
- Primary education: 5
- Lower secondary 2A: 4
- Upper secondary 3A: 4

Albania
- Pre-school: 6
- Primary education: 5
- Lower secondary 2A: 4
- Upper secondary 3A: 3
...but difference in VET enrolment
Selection and its effects

- In most countries, entry into upper secondary education is selective.

- **Selection reinforces social differentiation**
  - children of middle class parents are more likely to enter academic schools,
  - children of working class parents are more likely to enter vocational school

- Vocational schools tend to be less well resourced than academic schools, leading to lower quality of education.

- Consequently, initial gaps in student performance may widen, increasing inequality in educational outcomes.
Parents’ educational level

- No education
- Primary education
- Secondary vocational
- Secondary general
- University
- Other

Father's education level
Mother's education level
Parental employment and home study deficit

- **No quiet place:**
  - Parents do not work: 33.3%
  - Parents work: 27.1%

- **No internet:**
  - Parents do not work: 27.1%
  - Parents work: 14.0%

- **No own room:**
  - Parents do not work: 25.8%
  - Parents work: 15.9%

- **No books:**
  - Parents do not work: 25.7%
  - Parents work: 20.3%

- **No computer:**
  - Parents do not work: 24.0%
  - Parents work: 11.3%

- **No desk:**
  - Parents do not work: 12.7%
  - Parents work: 8.1%
Happiness at school

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Unhappy</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Happy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kosovo</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montenegro</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macedonia</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnia</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Israel</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Experience at school: main trends

• Almost three fifths of the students say that ‘much’ or ‘very much’ improvement is needed in **school equipment**, while almost a half say the same for **school buildings**

• One fifth of students found **teachers were not welcoming** when they began their schooling

• A fifth of students also experienced some form of **bullying** at school

• Students are **ambitious**
  – Almost all (84%) realise that it is very important for them to do well at school for their future job prospects.
Whether teachers were friendly and student happiness

- Very unfriendly: 28% Unhappy, 21% Content, 51% Happy
- Unfriendly: 19% Unhappy, 27% Content, 54% Happy
- Average: 24% Unhappy, 39% Content, 36% Happy
- Friendly: 35% Unhappy, 42% Content, 23% Happy
- Very friendly: 55% Unhappy, 26% Content, 19% Happy
Experience at school: teaching quality

• Students were ambivalent about the quality of teaching:
  
  – Over half say that they learn “very much” or “much” from their course, while 10% say they learn “little” or “nothing”
  
  – Only one fifth of students said that they thought the teaching methods were “very good” while 15% found them “very bad” or “poor”
  
  – Over two thirds reported that teachers’ knowledge of their subjects is “very good” or “good”, while 13.4% found them to be “very bad” or “poor”.
How much students learn

- Kosovo
- Israel
- Serbia
- Turkey
- Montenegro
- Macedonia
- Croatia
- Bosnia
- Albania

Legend:
- Blue: Nothing
- Checkered: A little
- Striped: A moderate amount
Practical training

- **Practical training**, either within school or in a local company as an intern or apprentice, is insufficient to provide a sound basis of vocational knowledge and experience (*interviews*).

- **Hours in work placement in a company** differ widely across schools and countries. Hours vary from a low of 0.6 hours in Podgorica to 15.2 hours in Karlovac in Croatia.

- There is also a huge between-school and cross-country variation in weekly hours spent in practical lessons.
Hours spent in practical lessons

- Turkey: Students - 16.0, Teachers - 12.3
- Albania: Students - 10.4, Teachers - 10.0
- Israel: Students - 8.1
- Croatia: Students - 7.7
- All: Students - 6.9, Teachers - 7.1
- Kosovo: Students - 4.4, Teachers - 6.9
- BiH: Students - 3.6, Teachers - 4.6
- Montenegro: 2.5
- Macedonia: 1.8
Social networks and job search

• Over three quarters of students expect to receive help from their families
  – Only about one third expect help from PES or school

• A major hindrance to students in their attempts to find a job is the lack of career guidance and counselling

• Students whose parents do not go out to work rely less on family assistance in finding a job than those with a parent in work

• This suggests the importance of social networks and connections in finding a job in the WBT+I countries.
Conclusions (I)

• Education systems are a powerful source of transmission of social exclusion

• Cascading effect of exclusion as students progress through school and beyond

• Selection on entry channels disadvantaged children into vocational school

• Family background has strong effect on school selection and on educational outcomes
Conclusions (II)

- **Experience in school** reinforces social exclusion of disadvantaged students due to:
  - Under-investment in equipment and buildings
  - Outdated curricula
  - Poor teaching methods
  - Apprenticeships offered to more advantaged students

- **Transition from school to work**
  - Lack of career guidance
  - Strong role of family contacts in finding a job
What can be done? - Students’ views

- **What do students think** could be done to improve their job prospects?
  - Almost two thirds - **better access to computers**
  - Almost two thirds - **better teaching methods**
  - Three fifths of - **better job counselling**
  - More than half - **better equipment**
  - More than half - **more relevant curricula**
  - Almost half - **better buildings**
  - Just under a half - **better out of school training** in companies
Recommendations
VET policy

• More **cooperation** needed between ministries and agencies involved in setting the institutional and policy framework for inclusive VET systems

• More **integration** between education and social policies for vulnerable groups

• More **engagement** by the social partners and local government institutions in the policy debate
Entry to school

- VET secondary schools should improve cooperation with primary schools to improve selection of disadvantaged students.

- The number of scholarships for VET studies from local and national governments and other stakeholders (e.g. businesses) should be increased.
Experience at school

- **Parents representatives and social partners** should play a stronger role in school governance.

- The skills and professionalism of teachers should be improved though **additional teacher training** especially for dealing with socially excluded students.

- Governments should seek infrastructure loans to **improve school buildings** from WBIF and other sources.
Dropping Out

• Reduce drop out by creating a more friendly environment for all students

• Offer individual guidance to students at risk of dropping out

• Improve the capacity of schools and local institutions to monitor dropout and identify its causes
Transition from Education to Work

• Provide more and better **career guidance services** to improve the social inclusion impact of vocational education

• **Local employers** should enhance their cooperation with schools to:
  – ensure updated curricula
  – increase the number of practical classes out of school
  – provide apprenticeship training for students
Social Cohesion

• Schools should seek to support more extra-curricular activities, including volunteer internships, voluntary work, and greater involvement with youth clubs and other community organisations.

• Vocational schools should forge closer links with local communities especially with NGOs and other voluntary organisations to develop a socially inclusive profile for VET schools.
Thank you for your attention !!!