

John Templeton Foundation Progress Report

Grant ID 12992

Project Leader Nancy Cartwright (LSE) and Eric Watkins (UCSD)

Reporting Period 1 January - 31 March 2012

Project Schedule

1. *Briefly summarize progress you made towards your project's objectives since your last report, including unanticipated results related to your grant. Where applicable, please reference your project timeline, benchmarks, work products, and outcomes/enduring impacts.*

As a result of working with project director Nancy Cartwright on pockets of order, Dr Eleonora Montuschi has published the book Objectivity and Scientific Evidence (sole author, in Italian; Carocci Ed. Rome 2011). The Templeton Foundation was mentioned in the Acknowledgments. A book launch will take place at the University of Venice on 16 April 2012, to which Nancy Cartwright has been invited.

Project Manager, Rebecca Robinson, finalized planning for the international team meeting in June 2012 at Selsdon Park in Surrey, UK. The research team have begun writing their chapters for the proposed Order Project volume, each to be discussed at the June meeting of which 18 members of the research team from both UK and the USA will attend.

The follow up meeting will take place 20 - 22 June 2013 in San Diego.

2. *Please explain whether you are on-track for completing your project's objectives. If you are not on track, please describe the challenges you are facing and your plans for getting back on track.*

Planning of the Project's events is moving forward as scheduled for Year Three.

Further engagements for the *Moral and Social Order* lecture series now include a talk by Sir Anthony Kenny, in Oxford, 2012 (Appendix I).

On 26 April, 2012, Professor Tom McLeish, Durham University, will give a talk for the Order Project, 'Why is Science such a Pain?' at the Ian Ramsey Centre for Religion and Science, Oxford (Abstract Appendix III).

On 8 May 2012, the project will host a seminar at LSE on 'Aristotelian Powers Now', with presentations by Nancy Cartwright and John Pemberton (LSE) and Anna Marmodoro (Oxford).

Significant Accomplishments

3. *Please describe any significant accomplishments since your last report (include attachments): research results, submitted articles, conference proceedings, print/electronic materials, media coverage, funding, etc.*

Co-Director, Eric Watkins, is progressing the volume resulting primarily from the papers presented at the Order Project UCSD conference, 'Historical Perspectives on God's Order, Man's Order and the Order of Nature' held in March 2011.

Objectivity and Scientific Evidence published by Dr Eleonora Montuschi.

Dissemination - LSE

Professor Nancy Cartwright continues to examine pockets of order and gave the following talks in this reporting period:

7, 9 March Rotman Institute Lectures, University of Western Ontario

'Evidence, Argument and Mixed Methods'

'Wiser Use of Social Science, Wiser Wishes, Wiser Policies'

21 March UT Dallas Center for Values in Medicine, Science & Technology

'Wiser Use of Science, Wiser Wishes, Wiser Policies'

Research Officer, Eric Martin

Eric Martin contributed to the Order Project at both LSE and UCSD during this quarter.

- 'Polkinghorne and Cartwright on Pluralism and Metaphysics' was accepted for publication at *Theology and Science*.
- Organized Lecture by Robert Wetman at UCSD (details below).
- Completed a draft of a paper with Eric Watkins: 'Evil and the History of Science'. The paper analyzes the ways in which natural sciences have shaped, and been shaped by, considerations about evil. From Leibniz's natural laws that informed his theodicy to Darwinian natural selection that apparently extends the scope of natural evils, the paper shows how sciences are relevant to philosophical discussions of evil.
- Met with theologians Nancey Murphy (Fuller Theological Seminary) on 16 February and Christopher Southgate (at Boyle Lecture) on 31 January in relation to work on a paper for the Oxford Philosophical Concepts: Evil.

- Participated in an ongoing (3 month) discussion on "Values and the Sciences" with members of LSE's CPNSS and Philosophy Department. This group researches and writes on the latest philosophical discussions on the ostensible boundaries between facts and values.
- Organized Bill Bechtel as a co-author for the Evil Project volume. He will also co-write an essay with Eric Martin on 'Mechanistic Explanation in the Life Sciences' for the forthcoming book project.

LSE Events

Professor Peyton Young unfortunately had to cancel his lecture, as part of the Moral and Social Order series. A new date for this lecture is being discussed.

UCSD Activities

Co-Director Eric Watkins presented a paper 'Kant on the Unconditioned' at the University of Notre Dame, on March 28.

17 February – 'What was the Question to which Copernicus's Hypothesis was the Answer?', a lecture by Robert S. Westman

This lecture, organized by Eric Martin, attracted an interdisciplinary crowd of historians and philosophers. The talk was part of his new book, The Copernican Question: Prognostication, Skepticism, and Celestial Order (2011, UC Press) and addressed the early history of science. It also has serious philosophical ramifications for whether we understand the Copernican episode as a revolutionary "paradigm shift" -- or otherwise (Abstract Appendix II).

Reading Groups:

Historical Aspects of Law and Order, read and discussed the following:

Bacon, "Principles and Origins"
 Malebranche, Search After Truth and Dialogues on Metaphysics and Religion
 Rutherford, "Malebranche's Theodicy"
 Clarke, "The Epistemology of Religious Belief"
 Malebranche, Treatise of Nature and Grace
 Schmaltz, "Laws and Order: Malebranche, Berkeley, and Hume"
 Adams, "Malebranche's Causal Concepts"

Law and Order (Contemporary) Reading Group Bibliography

van Frassen, *Laws and Symmetry*
 van Frassen, *The Scientific Image*

Callender and Cohen, "Special Sciences, Conspiracy, and the Better Best System Account of Lawhood"

Giere, "The Skeptical Perspective: Science without Laws of Nature"

Lewis, "New Work for a Theory of Universals" Lower, "Humean Supervenience"

Friedman, "The Methodology of Positive Economics"

Cartwright, "This World Causality"

Research Assistant Activities:

Nathan Rockwood completed a draft of a paper 'Locke on Miracles', organized the Historical Aspects of Law and Order Reading Group and participated in the Law and Order (Contemporary) Reading Group.

Peter Yong submitted 'Kant and the Order of Possibility' to the Discussion Paper Series. He will also present the paper at Biola University on April 25.

Database

Eric Martin continues to add new journal articles and monographs.

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/CPNSS/projects/orderProject/searchTheDatabase/home.aspx>

Additional Reporting Requirements

4. *In this section, please address any additional reporting requirements, i.e. Cost Effectiveness Statement as outlined in your Original Grant Agreement or any amendments to that Agreement.*

The Project continues to progress within budget overall. Accounts from both UCSD and LSE are attached.

Appendix I



The Moral and Social Order

A lecture series sponsored by the Templeton Project
In collaboration with the LSE Choice Group

Professor Geoffrey Hodgson
Business School, University of Hertfordshire
'What are Institutions?'
14 May 2012, Connaught House
5.30pm

Professor Garry Runciman
Trinity College, Cambridge
'The Surprising Coherence of Human Institutions'
21 May 2012, CPNSS
11am -1pm

Professor Avishai Margalit
Philosophy, Hebrew University of Jerusalem
2012
TBC

Sir Anthony Kenny
Fellow Emeritus, St John's College, Oxford
October 2012
Oxford

APPENDIX II

What Was the Question to which Copernicus's Hypothesis was the Answer?

Robert S. Westman

Nicolas Copernicus's hypothesis that the earth is a planet revolving together with five other planets around a stationary sun is one of the best known claims in the history of science. First announced publicly in print in 1543, historians often describe Copernicus's proposal as the beginning of the Scientific Revolution. But what was the problem-situation to which Copernicus's hypothesis was directed?

Based on his new book, The Copernican Question: Prognostication, Skepticism and Celestial Order, Westman proposes that crucial clues lie in a controversy about the status of astrology in the late fifteenth century. This debate continued to provide the framework for innovative astronomical responses into the seventeenth century.

Appendix III

Tom McLeish, 26 April 2012, Ian Ramsey Centre, Oxford

'Why is Science such a Pain? The Book of Job and an overlooked ancient narrative for science studies'.

Recent analysis of the public reception of problematic technologies (e.g. Macnaghten, J.-P. dePuy *et al.* the DEEPEN project) have unearthed the role that ancient narratives play beneath the surface of ostensibly technical debate around risk and acceptability. These narratives tend to support reactionary or conservative voices ("Pandora's Box", "The Sacred" etc.).

Yet there are other ancient narratives that propel the human relationship with nature in quite different directions. Perhaps surprisingly, one of these is found within Old Testament Wisdom literature, and supremely within the poetic jewel of the Book of Job. The "Lord's Answer" at the close of the book is one of the outstanding cosmological texts from the ancient Middle East, but has accrued a problematic critical reception. We attempt to look at the text through the unusual lens of the natural history of grappling with order and chaos, situating it within stories both theological and epistemological. What might be the effect of reconnecting today's public debates (nanotechnology, geoengineering, ...) to such rich sources?