

# John Templeton Foundation Progress Report

**Grant ID** 12992

**Project Leader** Nancy Cartwright (LSE) and Eric Watkins (UCSD)

**Reporting Period** 1 January – 31 March 2011

## Project Schedule

1. *Briefly summarize progress you made towards your project's objectives since your last report, including unanticipated results related to your grant. Where applicable, please reference your project timeline, benchmarks, work products, and outcomes/enduring impacts.*

## Historical Perspectives on God's Order, Man's Order and the Order of Nature

The first major conference, organized by Eric Watkins, was held at UCSD 4-6 March 2011. Details can be found below.

2. *Please explain whether you are on-track for completing your project's objectives. If you are not on track, please describe the challenges you are facing and your plans for getting back on track.*

Discussion papers and the research team's individual publications are on target to complete the number of publications envisaged by the project.

The project's events planning is also moving forward as envisaged for Year Three:

- 20 June 2011 LSE Seminar: Sandra Mitchell (Pittsburgh), whose work on the limits of natural order in the biological world helped motivate the Order project at its inception will speak on 'Integrative Pluralism: the case of Protein Folding'. Nicholas Smith, (Lewis & Clark College in Portland, Oregon) will review the arguments for and against a defense of naturalized epistemology in terms of survival (Abstracts attached Appendix I).
- 12 September 2011 theologian and member of the research team, Nancey Murphy, will visit the LSE and give a working seminar in Oxford (title to be announced).
- September 2011 (date TBA) Margaret Gilbert has been invited by the Order project to give a talk on how social institutions are built, what maintains them and

how to think about their effects. This is an area we would like to pursue in the context of man-made social order.

## **Significant Accomplishments**

3. *Please describe any significant accomplishments since your last report (include attachments): research results, submitted articles, conference proceedings, print/electronic materials, media coverage, funding, etc.*

## **Dissemination**

Nancy Cartwright continues to examine pockets of order and gave the following talks in this reporting period:

- Gusfield Lecture in Sociology, UCSD, 'The Long Road from 'It Works Somewhere to It will Work for Us'', March 2011.
- Linus Pauling Memorial Lecture, Institute for Science, Engineering and Public Policy, 'From Science to Policy. What's so Good about Evidence?', February 2011.

*She also published:*

Cartwright, Nancy D. Gabriele Contessa and Sheldon Steed, 'Keeping Track of Neurath's Bill: Abstract Concepts, Stock Models and the Unity of Classical Physics', Otto Neurath and the Unity of Science Olga Pombo, John Symons, Juan Manuel Torres (eds.), Springer: Stuttgart 2011 pp. 95-108.

## **Events**

### **Historical Perspectives on God's Order, Man's Order and the Order of Nature**

4-6 March 2011, UCSD was attended by 70 delegates. Sessions were chaired by members of the project research team from both the UK and the USA: Nancy Cartwright, Eric Watkins, Eleonora Montuschi, John Hedley Brooke, Margaret Yee, Dennis Des Chene and Russell ReManning. Research Officer, Eric Martin and Project Manager, Rebecca Robinson also attended to contribute to the event.

The speakers programme is attached (Appendix II). Some of the papers delivered at the conference may already be viewed on the conference web site and will contribute to the Project discussion paper series. In addition, a video of the conference will soon also be on the web.

Outcomes:

- The profile of the project is raised amongst the wider academic community, with all contributors asking to be kept apprised of the progress of the Order project. Attendants involved in research projects with overlapping themes also wanted to

be kept informed and the project manager is monitoring possible 'link exchange' with their websites.

The intellectual quality of the conference was extremely high. It also stimulated the contemporary side of the project, first by providing a kind of historical background of what options have been explored and second by revisiting these issues in the contemporary context. This provided the project with new perspectives for dealing with contemporary issues that are not currently to be found in the literature.

<http://philosophy.ucsd.edu/people/faculty-sites/watkins-conference/index.html>

### **'Let Newton Be'**

The Order project co-sponsored a performance of 'Let Newton Be' by the Menagerie Theatre Group on 28 March at the Royal Society in London. The play's three characters were Isaac Newton at three stages of his life, from youth to old age, in dialogue with each other. The dialogue was comprised of fragments of Newton's own writings, and dramatically re-created some of the major breakthroughs and controversies of his life. Among the most significant of these was Newton's debate with Leibniz on the nature of divine action: whether God was perpetually active through principles like the universal law of gravitation, or whether God interceded in his creation only at particular moments in time.

In a brief series of talks which followed the play, discussants including Martin Rees and Order project research team member John Hedley Brooke reflected on the scientific and theological significance of Newton's accomplishments.

This performance brought attention to the different (legitimate) attitudes that one might take towards the distinctive order envisioned by Newtonian science.

The project logo appeared on posters and other promotional literature. The project manager commissioned and distributed small flyers (Appendix III) at the event, which, in addition to the sponsorship itself, did much to raise the profile of the project amongst a more general audience.

### **New Reading Group LSE**

Research Officer Eric Martin has initiated and organized a reading group on the topic of 'Regularities and Exceptions in Nature and Society'. He has been assisted by the project's visiting research student Giulia Pravato (more below). It will include readings on laws of nature, *ceteris paribus* laws, conventions, and simplicity (Appendix IV).

The reading group is currently being publicized to the wider 'All London History & Philosophy of Science' community.

### **Website**

Changes to the website reported in December 2010 (listing upcoming project events on the home page) have had good results. After the home page, the events page is now the most viewed page of the website, with 196 visits for this quarter.

### **Publications Database**

The first entries in the publications repository database should be 'live' by the end of the next reporting period.

### **Additional Research at LSE**

Giulia Pravato, a research student from the dept of Philosophy, University of Ca' Foscari, Venice (Italy), is visiting for a semester till 31 July 2011 on the recommendation of Eleonora Montuschi. Giulia works on a comparative analysis of social conventions and laws of nature as two specific sources of order, and in particular on the concepts of deviation and exception. With Eleonora she is writing a paper in this area that will be submitted to the Order project DP series by the end of the summer.

Publications will form part of the discussion paper series.

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/CPNSS/projects/orderProject/Publications.aspx>

### **Additional Reporting Requirements**

4. *In this section, please address any additional reporting requirements, i.e. Cost Effectiveness Statement as outlined in your Original Grant Agreement or any amendments to that Agreement.*

The project continues to progress within budget. Although the LSE part of the project was 'overspent' in 2010, the under spend for 2009 more than compensated the difference. Financial statements for the third quarter of Year 2 (1 January - 31 March 2011) are attached.

In addition, the Expenditure Responsibility Report for 2010 was submitted in March 2011.

## **APPENDIX I**

### **LSE Seminar – 20 June 2011**

Nicholas Smith

In this paper, I review the arguments for and against a defense of naturalized epistemology in terms of survival, and then offer a rather different account of why human evolution supports the reliability of our cognitive equipment. The view for which we will argue is that philosophers' appeals to the processes of natural selection that are adaptive in terms of survival have provided an incomplete picture of what naturalists have available to them to make the sort of defense skeptics have claimed cannot be made. To supplement this picture, we provide evidence from what Darwin called "sexual selection" and also what others now call "social selection" to provide a more complete picture of why it is reasonable to suppose that evolution has supplied human beings and many other animals highly reliable and also veridical cognitive processes.

Sandra Mitchell

Integrative pluralism defends the view that there is scientific value in fostering different levels of description and explanation, and integration, rather than reduction, will produce the most informative accounts of the behavior of complex structures. I will explore this hypothesis by considering the case of protein folding behavior in biological systems. I will consider this behavior from three perspectives; first, the physics of the material constituents and their behavior, second, the chemistry of the molecular structure of proteins, how they acquire the structures they have and third, the biological function of proteins, especially the dependence of function on particular structures.

## APPENDIX II

### Historical Perspectives on God's Order, Man's Order and the Order of Nature March 4th to March 6th at UC San Diego Organized by Eric Watkins

---

#### Friday, March 4

- 9:00 am - 9:15 am     Welcome  
                             *Eric Watkins*, University of California, San Diego  
                             *Nancy Cartwright*, London School of Economics/University of California, San Diego  
                             *Eleonora Montuschi*, London School of Economics  
                             ~~~~~
- Chair:                    ***Dennis Des Chene*, Washington University, St. Louis**  
9:15 am - 10:45 am     *Marilyn McCord Adams*, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill  
                             "Powers versus Laws: God and the Order of Nature in Aquinas, Scotus, and Ockham"
- 11:15 am - 12:45 pm     *Steve Nadler*, University of Wisconsin, Madison  
                             "The Order of Nature and Moral Luck: Maimonides on Divine Providence"
- Chair:                    ***Peter Harrison*, Oxford University**  
2:30 pm - 4:00 pm     *Daniel Garber*, Princeton University  
                             "Divine Laws and Divine Decrees: Laws of Nature in Descartes and Leibniz"
- 4:30 pm - 6:00 pm     *Robert Merrihew Adams*, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill  
                             "Power, Cause, and Law in Malebranche's Occasionalism"

#### Saturday, March 5

- Chair:                    ***John Hedley Brooke*, Oxford University**  
9:00 am - 10:30 am     *Donald Rutherford*, University of California, San Diego  
                             "Laws and Powers in Leibniz"
- 11:00 am - 12:30 pm     *Martha Bolton*, Rutgers University  
                             "Leibniz on Monadic Change"
- Chair:                    ***Margaret Yee*, Oxford University**  
2:00 pm - 3:30 pm     *Andrew Chignell*, Cornell University  
                             "Kant and Leibniz on Miracles"


4:00 pm - 5:30 pm     *Karl Ameriks*, University of Notre Dame  
“Kant and the End of Theodicy”

**Sunday, March 6**

**Chair:**                     ***Nancey Murphy*, Fuller Theological Seminary**  
9:00 am - 10:30 am     *Desmond Hogan*, Princeton University  
“Kant's Theory of Divine and Secondary Causation”

11:00 am - 12:30 pm     *Eric Watkins*, University of California, San Diego  
“Kant on Man, God, and the Order of Nature”

## APPENDIX III




God's Order  
Man's Order  
and the Order of Nature

Our project evaluates modern conceptions of science that do not give laws of nature prime place in scientific prediction and explanation and considers the questions of God's nature and man's responsibility for natural and social order.

Visit us at:  
[www2.lse.ac.uk/CPNSS/projects/orderProject/home.aspx](http://www2.lse.ac.uk/CPNSS/projects/orderProject/home.aspx)

Info:  
[R.Robinson1@lse.ac.uk](mailto:R.Robinson1@lse.ac.uk)





## Appendix IV

### Regularities and their Exceptions in Nature and Society

This reading group will investigate order and disorder in nature and in society through an exploration of our foundational concepts of regularities, including natural laws and human conventions. We critically examine the nature of these regularities especially where they break down – that is, in their exceptions. How are exceptions managed in our dealing with regularities? How might they threaten laws, norms, or the simplicity of our accounts?

#### *Reading list*

#### Natural Laws

##### **Meeting 1 – 5 Apr**

- Cartwright, N. (2002) "In favour of Laws that Are Not Ceteris Paribus After All" *Erkenntnis* 57, pp. 425-439.
- Keert, G. (2003) "How the Ceteris Paribus Laws of Physics Lie"
- Sklar, L. "Dappled Theories in a Uniform World"

##### **Meeting 2 – 15 Apr**

- Smith, Sheldon. 2002. "Violated Laws, Ceteris Paribus Clauses and Capacities" *Synthese* 130: pp 235-264.

##### **Meeting 3 – 19 Apr**

- Lange, Marc. 2002. "Who's Afraid Of *Ceteris-Paribus* Laws? Or: How I Learned To Stop Worrying And Love Them" *Erkenntnis* 57: pp. 407-423
- Drewery, A. "Laws, Regularities and Exceptions", *Ratio*, 13, p. 1-12.
- Lowe, E.J. 1980. "Sortal Terms and Natural Laws: An Essay on the Ontological Status of the Laws of Nature" *American Philosophical Quarterly* 17:4 pp. 253-260

##### **Meeting 4 – 6 May**

- Teller, P. 2004. "The Law-Idealization" *Philosophy of Science*: 71: 5, pp. 730-741.
- Teller, P. 2002. "Review of Nancy Cartwright. The Dappled World." *Nous* 36: 4 pp. 699-725.

##### **Meeting 5 – 10 May**

- Sober, E. 2002. "What is the problem of simplicity?" in Keuzenkamp, McAleer, and Zellner (eds.) *Simplicity, inference, and econometric modelling*. Cambridge University Press.
- Sober, E. 1988. *Reconstructing the Past: Parsimony, Evolution, and Inference*. MIT Press. Selected chapters

##### **Meeting 6 – 17 May**

- Baker, A. 2007. "Occam's Razor in science: a case study from biogeography" *Biology and Philosophy* 22: 193-215.

## Social Conventions

### **Meeting 7 – 24 May**

- Marmor (1996) "On Convention", *Synthese* 107, pp. 349-371.
- Gilbert, M. (2008) "Social Conventions Revisited", *Topoi* 27, pp. 5-16.

### **Meeting 8 – 31 May**

- Sugden, R. (1989) "Spontaneous Order", *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 3, pp. 85-97.
- Amadae, S. M. (2010) "Normativity and Instrumentalism in David Lewis' Convention", *History of European Ideas* (Article in Press).

### **Meeting 9 – 7 June**

- Verbeek (2004) *Conventions and Cooperative Virtues. Some Observations on Evolutionary Game Theoretic Explanations of Social Norms*, <http://dspace.anu.edu.au/bitstream/1885/41069/1/W17.pdf>
- Dunne, P. E. (?) Failing to Comply: on deviating from social conventions
- Dequech, D. (2009) "Institutions, Social Norms and Decision-theoretic Norms", *Journal of Economic Behaviour and Organisation* 72, pp. 70-78.